

STATE OF MICHIGAN

MICHIGAN NATIONAL GUARD - AGENCY,

vs.

ADVERSE ACTION APPEAL

RENEE REED,

Appellant.

\_\_\_\_\_ /

MILITARY HEARING

BEFORE COLONEL KEVIN K. DAWKINS, HEARING EXAMINER

Camp Grayling, Michigan - Friday, October 17, 2014

APPEARANCES:

For the Agency:

CPT DAVID J. BEDELLS, ESQ., (P55590)

Deputy General Counsel

Michigan Army & Air National Guard

3411 N. Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd.

Lansing, michigan 48906

517-481-8100

For the Appellant:

BEN BANCHS

Laborers' International Union of

North America

Business Manager, National Guard

District Council

P.O. Box 1794

Abita Springs, Louisiana 70420

985-249-2315

Curtiss Reporting 2319418715

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Also Present: Renee Reed  
SSG Steven Schultz, Assist. CPT Bedells  
LTC Alice Niedergall  
MAJ Allyn Johnson, Labor Relations  
Specialist  
James Sweat, President 2132 Local  
Ja'net Vallotton, 2nd Chair to Mr.Banchs  
Thomas J. Hetchler, Jr., ESQ., (P71925)  
for LTC Michael McNamara

RECORDED BY: CURTISS REPORTING  
Post Office Box 6  
Traverse City, Michigan 49685  
(231) 941-8715  
Teresa A. Sotuyo, CER #4812

1

2

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

3

4

WITNESSES: APPELLANT

PAGE:

5

6

SERGEANT KATHRYN BARRICK

7

Direct Examination by Mr. Banchs

5

8

Cross-Examination by Captain Bedells

13

9

10

CHIEF DEAN MILLER

11

Direct Examination by Mr. Banchs

15

12

Cross-Examination by Captain Bedells

23

13

14

MASTER SERGEANT MICHAEL HOAG

15

Direct Examination by Mr. Banchs

26

16

Examination by Hearing Examiner

29

17

18

SERGEANT CASEY ELLIS

19

Direct Examination by Mr. Banchs

32

20

21

LIEUTENANT COLONEL MIKE PERRICANE (via telephone)

22

Direct Examination by Mr. Banchs

39

23

24

MAJOR JEREMY RUBY (via telephone)

25

Direct Examination by Mr. Banchs

45

1	TABLE OF CONTENTS	
2		
3		PAGE :
4	MASTER SERGEANT TIMOTHY SHELDON	
5	Direct Examination by Mr. Banchs	51
6	Cross-Examination by Captain Bedells	55
7	Redirect Examination by Mr. Banchs	59
8		
9	RETIRED CHIEF JAMES REED	
10	Direct Examination by Mr. Banchs	61
11	Cross-Examination by Captain Bedells	75
12	Examination by Hearing Examiner	76
13		
14		
15	WITNESSES: THE AGENCY	
16		
17	COLONEL MICHAEL MCNAMARA	
18	Direct Examination by Captain Bedells	79
19	Cross-Examination by Mr. Banchs	94
20	Redirect Examination by Captain Bedells	98
21	Recross Examination by Mr. Banchs	104
22	Redirect Examination by Captain Bedells	105
23	Recross Examination by Mr. Banchs	106
24	Redirect Examination by Captain Bedells	108
25	Examination by Hearing Examiner	109

1 Grayling, Michigan

2 Friday, October 17, 2014 - at 8:04 a.m.

3 HEARING EXAMINER: Let's go on the record.

4 COURT REPORTER: We are on the record. Today  
5 is October 17, 2014. The time is 8:04 a.m.

6 HEARING EXAMINER: Thank you. Raise your right  
7 hand, please. Do you swear or affirm that the testimony  
8 you're about to give in this case is the truth, the whole  
9 truth, and nothing but the truth so help you God?

10 MASTER SERGEANT BARRICK: Yes, sir.

11 HEARING EXAMINER: Further, you are advised  
12 that you are assured the freedom from restraint,  
13 interference, discrimination, coercion, or reprisal for  
14 testifying in this case. And you may have a seat. Mr.  
15 Banchs?

16 MR. BANCHS: Thank you, sir.

17 SERGEANT KATHRYN BARRICK

18 (At 8:04 a.m., sworn as a witness, testified as follows)

19 DIRECT EXAMINATION

20 BY MR. BANCHS:

21 Q Good morning. How are you today?

22 A **I'm nervous.**

23 Q That's fine. How long have you known Sergeant Reed for?

24 I'm sorry. Can you state your name for the record, ma'am?

25 A **Sergeant Barrick.**

1 Q What's your first name?

2 A **Kathryn.**

3 Q And what do you do at the MATES?

4 A **Well, I don't work at MATES anymore. But when I did, I was**

5 **a production controller.**

6 Q Okay. And where do you work now?

7 A **I work in Midland, FMS22.**

8 Q And when did that start?

9 A **August of last year.**

10 Q And how long have you been in the military?

11 A **Twelve years.**

12 Q And just for our curiosity, what's your MDA job?

13 A **I work full time for FMS22--oh, sorry. I'm 92 Alpha is**

14 **what I--**

15 Q Okay. Now we'll go back to the question. How long have you

16 known Sergeant Reed for?

17 A **Since January 2011.**

18 Q 2011? Okay. And what was your interactions with her at

19 work? Can you describe, you know, your duties or how you

20 interacted with Sergeant Reed?

21 A **We were both production controllers, so she was a senior**

22 **production controller, and I was the junior.**

23 Q And how often did you work with Sergeant Reed?

24 A **Quite a bit.**

25 Q Quite a bit? Like on a daily basis?

1    **A**    **Like hourwise?**

2    Q    Yeah. Just, you know, throughout the day?

3    **A**    **Yeah, throughout the day; yeah. I don't know.**

4    Q    So you had occasion to observe her in her office? How

5       often were you in her office?

6    **A**    **Depending on the day, I don't know, two, three hours**

7       **maybe.**

8    Q    Okay. And was it work-related? Was it nonwork-related? I

9       mean, what was the general interaction between you and

10       Sergeant Reed?

11   **A**    **It was both.**

12   Q    It was both?

13   **A**    **Yeah.**

14   Q    Was--would there be any other people in the office while

15       you were there or while you weren't there?

16   **A**    **Of course, yes.**

17   Q    And who would that be?

18   **A**    **It may be the other production controllers, basically**

19       **anybody, you know, Lieutenant Colonel Golnick, basically a**

20       **lot of people were--you know, people were in there.**

21   Q    Fair enough. Now, I'm sure you know--well, I don't know if

22       you do know. But the reason that we're here is because

23       Sergeant Reed was terminated for allegedly having an

24       inappropriate relationship with Colonel Golnick. Okay?

25       It's been fairly established that Colonel Golnick was in

1 her office a bit. So how would--how much would you  
2 describe Colonel Golnick being in Sergeant Reed's office?

3 **A He was in there a lot.**

4 **Q** What would he do while he was in there? Was it  
5 work-related? Was it nonwork-related?

6 **A It was--it was both.**

7 **Q** It was both? It's fine. You can describe what--what took  
8 place in the office. It's no big deal.

9 **A They were friends so, I mean--I don't know. My deal--I**  
10 **mean, my thing, you know, we're human first and then we're**  
11 **soldiers second. And you know, when you work with somebody**  
12 **for ten years, you know, you're going to build a bond.**  
13 **And, heck, I only worked with Renee for, you know, a**  
14 **couple of years and, you know, I built a bond with her. I**  
15 **mean--**

16 **Q** Now, when you say they were friends, you're talking about  
17 Colonel Golnick and Sergeant Reed?

18 **A Yes.**

19 **Q** And when you say they were friends, describe--was it just  
20 a work friendship? Was it an outside-of-work friendship?  
21 What was your understanding of that friendship?

22 **A I think it was both.**

23 **Q** It was both?

24 **A Yeah.**

25 **Q** Okay. Now, you say you worked with Renee for a short time



1 compared to other people, but you formed a friendship bond  
2 with her as well?

3 **A Of course.**

4 Q Was that something that--that it seemed that it was hard  
5 for people to do, to bond with Renee, whether they were  
6 male or female?

7 **A I don't think so. I didn't have a problem with it.**

8 Q Okay. And I mean, these interactions that she has with  
9 others, whether it's Colonel Golnick, whether it's  
10 yourself, is there anything that you consider  
11 inappropriate?

12 **A I don't.**

13 Q You don't?

14 **A I don't, no.**

15 Q Now, in your statement that you provided the Hearing  
16 Examiner, in your sworn statement, you did say that you  
17 didn't personally have any problems working with Master  
18 Sergeant Reed and Lieutenant Colonel Golnick but you did  
19 highlight how he did bring her breakfast a lot and that he  
20 brought her drinks and on the days that he didn't bring  
21 breakfast that she would bring him health shakes, that it  
22 was a friendship-based relationship, outside of work as  
23 well.

24 **A Uh-huh.**

25 Q But you did say that--and I just want to get this

1 right--that you believed that many perceived the  
2 relationship to be inappropriate and that you also  
3 believed that it was a little inappropriate but it didn't  
4 bother you. Explain to me what you mean by being a little  
5 inappropriate.

6 **A Well, in the military, you know, there's--you're not--you**  
7 **know, he's an officer and she's enlisted. And so there is**  
8 **a line there. But I just meant I don't think they crossed**  
9 **it and, you know, they were friends. I don't see a problem**  
10 **with them being friends.**

11 **Q** Okay. So the inappropriateness would--would it be fair to  
12 say that the reason that the relationship might have  
13 appeared inappropriate was solely based on their rank?

14 **A Yeah.**

15 **Q** So had he been a Master Sergeant as well, would it have  
16 been inappropriate? Would anybody--how can I ask this?  
17 Would you have perceived the relationship to be  
18 inappropriate had they been the same rank?

19 **A No.**

20 **Q** In your experience, whether it was working with her as a  
21 coworker or just as a friend, did--Colonel Golnick's  
22 coming into the office or anybody else for that matter  
23 coming into the office, did it ever prevent Sergeant Reed  
24 from performing her duties?

25 **A Maybe a little bit yeah. I mean--**

1 Q In what way?

2 A Well, I mean, it wasn't always work-related and, you know,  
3 he would be in there and prevent her--they had to work  
4 together.

5 Q Yes ma'am.

6 A You know, he was the boss. But, yeah, I mean, maybe there  
7 was sometimes where she'd say, you know, "hey, he won't  
8 get out of my office. I've got work to do," and that kind  
9 of stuff.

10 Q So she would complain that he was coming into the office  
11 too much? Now, we've had testimony here that Sergeant Reed  
12 is, by some accounts and even in your account, that--and  
13 this is in the statement that you provided to us. Would  
14 you like to read it or do you remember what you wrote?

15 A I'm pretty sure I remember what I wrote.

16 Q If you don't mind, reread your statement to yourself just  
17 so you can refresh your memory. Okay. Your statement--and  
18 just for your knowledge, everybody else who has testified  
19 here before you agrees with you that--that Sergeant Reed  
20 was more than likely the best production controller in the  
21 state. Okay? And that's really what my question--even with  
22 Colonel Golnick coming in her office and obviously her  
23 complaining about him coming in her office and that he was  
24 perhaps preventing her from doing some of her job, did she  
25 still manage to get her job done?

1    **A**     **Of course, yes.**

2    **Q**     Okay. I'm getting ready to turn it over to Captain  
3            Bedells, who is the Agency's representative. He's going to  
4            ask you some questions as well. But I'll end with this and  
5            I'll ask you this. In your opinion--and obviously your  
6            experience at the MATES is not as long as others because  
7            you only started working there in 2011.

8    **A**     **Uh-huh.**

9    **Q**     But in your opinion and from your experience, do you  
10           believe that Sergeant Reed should have been fired?

11   **A**     **No, not at all.**

12   **Q**     And can you explain that, your opinion?

13   **A**     **My theory is if you work hard and you do the job that**  
14           **you're getting paid to do, then nothing else should really**  
15           **matter. I mean, she worked hard. She did her job, you**  
16           **know. Everybody else, you know, has friendships in and**  
17           **outside of work. And I just--I don't think that that**  
18           **should have been a basis for her being fired. I don't**  
19           **think she should have been fired at all.**

20   **Q**     But even you yourself say that the relationship that  
21           Colonel Golnick and her had was a little bit  
22           inappropriate, even with you having said that, you still  
23           believe that she shouldn't have been fired?

24   **A**     **No, I still don't--I think she should have been--should**  
25           **have kept her job, yes.**

1 Q Okay. And then I probably know this answer already but I  
2 will ask you. If Sergeant Reed was to be reinstated, would  
3 you necessarily have an issue with that? Or would you be  
4 okay with it?

5 A **That would be--she could come work with me.**

6 MR. BANCHS: Okay, great. Thank you very much,  
7 Sergeant.

8 HEARING EXAMINER: Captain Bedells?

9 MR. BANCHS: Your witness.

10 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Thanks.

11 CROSS-EXAMINATION

12 BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

13 Q Sergeant Barrick, pretty nervous?

14 A **Yes.**

15 Q Did you tell the truth here today?

16 A **Yes.**

17 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Okay. I don't have any  
18 questions.

19 HEARING EXAMINER: Redirect?

20 MR. BANCHS: No, sir. That's it.

21 HEARING EXAMINER: Okay. Sergeant Barrick,  
22 I'll remind you that you remain under oath and that you  
23 are subject to recall to this hearing until such time that  
24 this hearing has been adjourned. I will remind you not to  
25 discuss your testimony with anyone else.

1 THE WITNESS: Yes, sir.

2 HEARING EXAMINER: And with that, you are free  
3 to go.

4 THE WITNESS: Yes, sir. Thank you.

5 MR. BANCHS: Thank you. Have a good day.

6 HEARING EXAMINER: Thank you.

7 (At 8:15 a.m., witness excused)

8 HEARING EXAMINER: You've got the next one?  
9 Who's next?

10 MR. BANCHS: Chief Miller.

11 HEARING EXAMINER: Is there also no interview  
12 with him?

13 MR. BANCHS: Sir, there was an interview, but  
14 there is no notes.

15 HEARING EXAMINER: Okay. Thanks.

16 MR. BANCHS: You're welcome.

17 HEARING EXAMINER: Okay. Chief, welcome back.

18 CHIEF MILLER: Good morning.

19 HEARING EXAMINER: Stay standing for just a  
20 second--

21 CHIEF MILLER: Okay.

22 HEARING EXAMINER: --and I'll swear you in.

23 Raise your right hand, please. Do you swear or affirm that  
24 the testimony you're about to give in this case is the  
25 truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth so help

1           you God?

2                           CHIEF MILLER: I do.

3                           HEARING EXAMINER: Further, you are advised  
4           that you are assured the freedom from restraint,  
5           interference, discrimination, coercion, or reprisal for  
6           testifying in this case. You may have a seat. Mr. Banchs?

7                           MR. BANCHS: Thank you, sir.

8                           CHIEF DEAN M. MILLER

9           (At 8:17 a.m., sworn as a witness, testified as follows)

10                           DIRECT EXAMINATION

11 BY MR. BANCHS:

12 Q       Good morning, Chief.

13 A       **Good morning. How are you?**

14 Q       All right. Sir, before I start asking you questions, if  
15       you don't mind reading the statement that you provided as  
16       a character reference on behalf of Mrs. Reed just to  
17       refresh your memory. You don't have to read it out loud.

18 A       **Okay.**

19 Q       Chief, and I'm sorry, I've got to do some housekeeping  
20       here. I forgot to ask you if you could state your name,  
21       your rank and your position?

22 A       **Dean Miller, CW4 MATES shop foreman.**

23 Q       Okay. And how long have you been at the MATES?

24 A       **Twenty-six years in March.**

25 Q       And how long have you been in the military, sir?

1    **A**    **Almost--it'll be 27 in July.**

2    Q    And the position you currently hold, how long have you  
3        been in that position?

4    **A**    **About three months.**

5    Q    And prior to your current job, what did you do before?

6    **A**    **I was FMT1 supervisor.**

7    Q    And your current position is post this investigation? The  
8        current position that you hold--

9    **A**    **This is as MATES shop foreman.**

10   Q    Yes, sir. And you just--you became the shop foreman after  
11        this investigation; is that correct?

12   **A**    **Yes.**

13   Q    Okay. All right, sir, obviously we're here because  
14        Sergeant Reed was terminated for two individual--well, it  
15        was two of them. One was broken down into four different  
16        things. But basically inappropriate relationship with  
17        Lieutenant Colonel Golnick and her misuse of government  
18        vehicles or alleged misuse of government vehicles. Are you  
19        familiar with that?

20   **A**    **Just based on the questions I was asked and comments that  
21        were made after the investigation began, yes, pretty much.**

22   Q    And you--and you provided a personal interview with the  
23        investigating officer, Colonel Doolittle, and then you  
24        also subsequently provided a sworn statement?

25   **A**    **Right.**



1 MR. BANCHS: Do we have the first book?

2 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Right. here.

3 BY MR. BANCHS:

4 Q Sir, that's a sworn statement that's in the record that  
5 you provided the investigating officer. If you could just  
6 read paragraph 1, inappropriate relationships, to refresh  
7 your memory on that.

8 A Okay.

9 Q Okay, sir. There has been testimony provided here  
10 that--that Lieutenant Colonel Golnick was in Sergeant  
11 Reed's office quite a bit. What is your recollection or  
12 experience with that if you could share that with us?

13 A Well, based on my sworn statement and what I recall, he  
14 was in that office quite a bit. But, again, that position  
15 that she held as a GS9 production controller--and he was  
16 acting as the shop foreman as well as the  
17 superintendent--it caused a lot of interaction based on  
18 our mission. That's kind of where I saw the--I, again,  
19 didn't hear them ever speak of any inappropriate  
20 conversations.

21 Q Did you not hear because you did not have occasion to be  
22 near or in that office--

23 A No, I didn't--

24 Q --on a regular basis?

25 A I did not work in that area, no. But, you know, when I

1 would pop in to find Colonel Golnick to ask him a  
2 question, I never heard any strange or inappropriate--

3 Q Yes, sir.

4 A --conversations.

5 Q Now, in the course of your own duties at the time, before  
6 you became the foreman, did you have any reason to  
7 interact with Sergeant Reed in that office?

8 A Yes.

9 Q Okay. And were your--can you describe those interactions?

10 A It was basically mission-oriented. My team would, you  
11 know, often have issues with job orders or issues with  
12 time and attendance, man-hour accounting more than time  
13 and attendance, but things like that.

14 Q And your impression of Sergeant Reed's performance, can  
15 you share that with us? I mean, you've already shared that  
16 in the statement, but just for the record?

17 A She was a great worker, always upbeat, never seemed to be  
18 in a bad mood. She kept things running. We actually still  
19 use some of the SOPs that she created. As far as her work  
20 ethic, it was outstanding actually.

21 Q Would you consider her termination a loss to the MATES?

22 A Yes.

23 Q Okay. And how long you been knowing Sergeant Reed, either  
24 personally or professionally?

25 A Basically I really didn't meet her until she started at

1           **the shop, and I'm not even sure what year that was. But**  
2           **I'm guessing ten years-ish, something like that.**

3    Q       And in your experience just--and again your interaction  
4           with her, is it primarily professional?

5    A       **Uh-huh.**

6    Q       Are there any kind of social interactions there, whether  
7           it--

8    A       **No.**

9    Q       --it be shop parties or anything like that?

10   A       **Well, Christmas party, if you want to call that a social**  
11           **event, yes, once a year.**

12   Q       Roger that. So would it be--is it your impression of  
13           Sergeant Reed that she is a friendly individual and she  
14           gets along with everybody?

15   A       **Yes.**

16   Q       Would you say that a lot of people like her or get along  
17           with her?

18   A       **Uh-huh.**

19   Q       Okay. Concerning the use of--concerning the use of GSAs,  
20           Sergeant Reed was also terminated for inappropriate use of  
21           GSAs or NTVs--I'm sorry. And I know that--I know that  
22           there is a difference. But whether it's GSA or NTV, it's a  
23           government-owned vehicle?

24   A       **Uh-huh.**

25   Q       Can you share with me what--and I know that there's an AR,

1 and I know that there's a State SOP that covers use of  
2 NTVs and GSAs. But just from your perspective as an  
3 employee at the MATES, can you share with me what--what  
4 the standard practice was for individuals using either a  
5 GSA or an NTV to attend--whether they were drills, whether  
6 they were AT or any other type of work-related function.  
7 Can you share that with me?

8 **A I'll share my point of view and what I was talked to about**  
9 **as--I work for the SMO section as well, and Colonel Maddin**  
10 **was the SMO at the time, overall in charge of all the GSAs**  
11 **and NTVs that we used as in the maintenance community. His**  
12 **intent that the GSA or NTV only be used to go to a--like I**  
13 **was on a MATES team, so we would go to different areas.**  
14 **Our home of record would be Lansing. If we drilled in**  
15 **Lansing, we drove a POV. If we went to external facilities**  
16 **to represent the state, then we could use an NTV or a GSA.**  
17 **I know Sergeant Reed, as a food service NCO, probably was**  
18 **in the same kind of relation as far as that operation. So**  
19 **that'd be the only thing that I could add on that.**

20 **Q** Okay. Would it--would it be out of the norm for Sergeant  
21 Reed or anybody else to perhaps take an NTV to a drill  
22 period or to an AT, whether it was because of their duties  
23 or whether it was because of a request--it was requested  
24 by somebody higher up?

25 **A** Can you--I'm not sure where you're going with that, sir.

1 Q I'm sorry. Well, you know what, I'll ask it a different  
2 way. Have you ever used an NTV to go to drill or AT or any  
3 other work-related function?

4 A Yes.

5 Q And could you share your experience if you don't mind?

6 A Well, it's basically what I just told you. If we were  
7 going to home of record, we were not supposed to use an  
8 NTV or a GSA.

9 Q Roger that. Okay.

10 A But if we went to outlying facilities or if it was a day  
11 run out here to camp because we got a call at the shop and  
12 they needed some help with something, then we could use  
13 one to run out there. But that's basically what they were  
14 set up for, official use.

15 Q Did you ever either firsthand see Sergeant Reed use an NTV  
16 inappropriately? Or have you ever heard of her using an  
17 NTV inappropriately?

18 A I've heard of it since the investigation started. I did  
19 see her use NTVs and GSAs but to be honest, I don't really  
20 know if it was to go to drill or a mission for the food  
21 service side of it.

22 Q Before this investigation started, when you did see  
23 Sergeant Reed use an NTV, did you have any suspicions that  
24 it might not have been--it might have been inappropriate?

25 A No.

1 Q Okay. I'll just get to the point, sir. Based on your  
2 knowledge of what's going on and obviously you provided a  
3 statement of character reference for Sergeant Reed, do you  
4 think she should have been terminated?

5 A No. I think this whole investigation probably could have  
6 been handled differently from my point of view. I'm not a  
7 legal guy by any means, but I think we could have done  
8 some more research at the beginning instead of this  
9 getting into like a giant sensing session instead of an  
10 investigation. But, again, that's my opinion.

11 A Roger that. Now, it has been stated by numerous  
12 individuals that--and even supporters of Sergeant Reed  
13 that whether the relationship was--even if there wasn't  
14 anything sexual perhaps going on, that the relationship  
15 did appear to be inappropriate due to the amount of  
16 interaction that Colonel Golnick had with Sergeant Reed.  
17 So how would you have handled that aspect of it?

18 A Me as a leader or me--

19 Q Yes, sir. And--

20 A --as Chief Miller? Because I can't speak for other people.  
21 They have their own opinions and their own decisions to  
22 make. But, you know, I guess if we could go back in time  
23 and start over, if maybe some more focus should have come  
24 from the leadership side. Okay, if there's an issue going  
25 on, why don't we take care of it at that point?

1 Q Roger that, sir.

2 A **Otherwise, you know, we wouldn't be here right now.**

3 Q Okay. And a follow-up--and I think I know the answer but  
4 would you--and especially being the shop foreman now,  
5 would you have any issue with Sergeant Reed being  
6 reinstated to the MATES?

7 A **No. The only issue I would have is personnel, based on  
8 what's happened up to this point.**

9 Q Roger that. And what does that mean, personnel?

10 A **Well, just a lot of--since this investigation started,  
11 there's a lot of conflict between personalities and  
12 people. I don't know that putting all those people back in  
13 the same building is going to be a good idea, at least not  
14 right away.**

15 Q Okay. But as far as her returning as an employee of the  
16 Michigan National Guard--

17 A **Right.**

18 Q --would you necessarily have an issue with that?

19 A **No.**

20 Q Okay. Thank you, sir.

21 A **Uh-huh.**

22 MR. BANCHS: I'll turn it over to Captain  
23 Bedells.

24 HEARING EXAMINER: Captain Bedells?

25 CROSS-EXAMINATION

1 BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

2 Q Chief, just so I'm clear, you don't think there was  
3 anything inappropriate about the relationship Master  
4 Sergeant Reed and Lieutenant Colonel Golnick had?

5 A **Again, as I stated in here, it did seem they had a lot of**  
6 **interaction at lunchtime, stuff like that. As far as their**  
7 **actual conversations, I never witnessed anything that**  
8 **would be sexual or inappropriate.**

9 Q I don't mean sexual. I just mean inappropriate. I think  
10 your sworn statement says you don't--you don't think there  
11 was anything inappropriate about this relationship. Right?

12 A **I don't think so.**

13 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Okay. I don't have any  
14 further questions.

15 HEARING EXAMINER: Redirect?

16 MR. BANCHS: No, sir. I don't have any.

17 HEARING EXAMINER: All right. Chief, I'll  
18 remind you that you remain under oath and that you are  
19 subject to recall to this hearing until such time that it  
20 has been adjourned. And I will remind you not to discuss  
21 your testimony with anyone else.

22 THE WITNESS: Roger.

23 HEARING EXAMINER: And with that, I thank you  
24 for your time, and you're free to go.

25 THE WITNESS: Okay.



1 HEARING EXAMINER: Thanks.

2 THE WITNESS: Thank you.

3 (At 8:29 a.m., witness excused)

4 STAFF SERGEANT SCHULTZ: I don't think there's  
5 anything--there's nothing in the record from him, is  
6 there?

7 MR. BANCHS: No.

8 STAFF SERGEANT SCHULTZ: Just in the rebuttal?

9 MR. BANCHS: It's just rebuttal sworn  
10 statement.

11 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: And it's just one line long;  
12 right?

13 MR. BANCHS: That's it.

14 HEARING EXAMINER: Please remain standing for  
15 just a second and raise your right hand, please. Do you  
16 swear or affirm that the testimony you're about to give in  
17 this case is the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but  
18 the truth so help you God?

19 SERGEANT HOAG: I do.

20 HEARING EXAMINER: Further, you are advised  
21 that you are assured the freedom from restraint,  
22 interference, discrimination, coercion, or reprisal for  
23 testifying in this case. And what that, you can have a  
24 seat.

25 SERGEANT HOAG: Thank you.

1 HEARING EXAMINER: Mr. Banchs?

2 MR. BANCHS: Thank you, sir.

3 MASTER SERGEANT MICHAEL HOAG

4 (At 8:31a.m., sworn as a witness, testified as follows)

5 DIRECT EXAMINATION

6 BY MR. BANCHS:

7 Q Good morning.

8 A **Good morning.**

9 Q Sir, can you state your rank and your name and what you  
10 currently do for the Michigan National Guard?

11 A **I am Master Sergeant Michael V. Hoag. I work for Camp  
12 Grayling itself here. I'm the housing manager. I take care  
13 of everything that's tan on Camp Grayling.**

14 Q And that's your full-time position?

15 A **That's my full-time position.**

16 Q And what do you do on the unit side, sir?

17 A **On the unit side, I'm the operations NCO for the 272RSG.**

18 Q Okay. How--describe your--how long have you been knowing  
19 Sergeant Reed for?

20 A **I've known of her for probably six, eight years. To really  
21 get to know her or anything like that, it's probably the  
22 last--since we've joined the unit. And I've only been in  
23 the unit since 2012 so--**

24 Q So while--you've been knowing her for a little bit over  
25 two years?

1    **A**    **Yes.**

2    Q    But you guys were in the same unit up to the point where  
3        she was terminated as a technician earlier this year in  
4        March?

5    **A**    **Yes.**

6    Q    Okay. Now, your role in this--and your testimony here is  
7        going to be very short because what we're trying to  
8        establish--and let me back up a little bit. Sergeant Reed  
9        obviously has been terminated. Are you aware of that?

10   **A**   **I have been told that, yes.**

11   Q    And one of the reasons that she was terminated was for  
12        allegedly inappropriately using nontactical vehicles. And  
13        some of that inappropriate use had to do with her  
14        allegedly driving nontactical vehicles to drill.

15   **A**    **Okay.**

16   Q    Okay? So your statement here--and I just want to make  
17        sure--just kind of following up on the statement--

18   **A**    **Sure.**

19   Q    --you provided in support of this investigation, sir. The  
20        statement that you provided is in front of you. If you  
21        don't mind, just reading that one sentence--

22   **A**    **"I Michael V Hoag want to make this following statement"--**

23   Q    Oh, you don't have to read it out loud, sir.

24   **A**    **Okay. Yes, that's what I wrote.**

25   Q    Okay, great. Now, the allegations that have been that

1 Sergeant Reed often, if not every time that she went to  
2 drill, would take a nontactical vehicle down there.

3 **A As is--as I've noticed since I've been in--since 2012,**  
4 **I've never noticed her to go to Jackson Readiness Center**  
5 **in anything but her POV. She has changed POVs but never**  
6 **anything but a POV.**

7 Q And you would know the difference between a POV and a  
8 government vehicle?

9 **A Oh, yes; yes, I would.**

10 Q Now, in your short--you said you have been knowing of  
11 Sergeant Reed for about six to eight years, and you  
12 personally interacted with her now for about two?

13 **A Right.**

14 Q Because you guys still drill together and she's--

15 **A Yes.**

16 Q --still in the National Guard?

17 **A Yes.**

18 Q Just a general character reference, what is your  
19 impression of Sergeant Reed as a soldier and as a person?

20 **A Very caring. She cares about the soldier. She tries to**  
21 **help other people out. I know that we just got back from**  
22 **an AT out in South Dakota, and she was willing to go the**  
23 **extra mile for anything that needed to be done at the AT.**

24 Q Every witness has testified so far--and understanding you  
25 don't know her on the technician side of the house--

1    **A     Right.**

2    Q     But it's been--it's been attested to that she is the best  
3           at what she does or she was the best at what she did as a  
4           technician. Would that strike you as odd? Would that--

5    **A     No, no, but I can't testify to that because I have never**  
6           **worked with her as a technician.**

7    Q     Roger that. Okay, sir, I think really that I don't want to  
8           ask you any more questions because you don't know her from  
9           the technician side of the house.

10   **A     Right.**

11                   MR. BANCHS: But thank you for your testimony  
12           today. I'm going to hand you back over to Captain Bedells.

13                   HEARING EXAMINER: Captain Bedells?

14                   CAPTAIN BEDELLS: No questions. I don't have  
15           any questions.

16                   HEARING EXAMINER: I have two.

17                   THE WITNESS: Sure.

18                                   EXAMINATION

19   BY HEARING EXAMINER:

20   Q     Have you ever seen Master Sergeant Reed use an NTV during  
21           a drill or during any time that you had military duty  
22           together?

23   **A     I think I seen her when we were out where you get ready**  
24           **for one AT personally.**

25   Q     Okay. And one more question, you see her every drill that

1 she attends since you've been in that same unit?

2 **A Yes.**

3 Q Can you say that you've seen her in her POV every single  
4 drill other than that one pre-AT that you just described?

5 And it's okay if you can't. I'm just--

6 **A I can't remember.**

7 Q Okay.

8 **A Because I've been to a lot of drills in 30 years.**

9 Q I'm just--yeah. I'm just trying to get some sense, because  
10 your statement says while attending IDT drill weekends at  
11 Jackson that you've observed her getting out--in and out  
12 of her POV. I'm just trying to get some sense--

13 **A Right.**

14 Q Is that most of the time? Is that--

15 **A That's at--the only time I've drilled with her is at  
16 Jackson Readiness Center.**

17 Q Okay. But you're not able to say--and, again, it's fair if  
18 you can't say it. But you're not able to say that every  
19 single time you drilled with her, she's had her POV?

20 **A The times at Jackson Readiness Center that's the only  
21 thing I've ever seen her--now--**

22 Q Okay. That's fair.

23 **A --that's all I know.**

24 HEARING EXAMINER: That's fair. Okay. Thank  
25 you. Do you want to follow up?

1 MR. BANCHS: No, sir.

2 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: No, thanks.

3 HEARING EXAMINER: All right, Sergeant Hoag,  
4 I'll remind you that you remain under oath and that you  
5 are subject to recall to this hearing until such time that  
6 it has been adjourned. And I will remind you please do not  
7 discuss your testimony with anyone.

8 THE WITNESS: Sure.

9 HEARING EXAMINER: And what that, I thank you  
10 for your time--

11 THE WITNESS: Thank you.

12 HEARING EXAMINER: --and you're free to go.

13 (At 8:37 a.m., witness excused)

14 LIEUTENANT COLONEL NIEDERGALL: I don't see  
15 Major Johnson. Who is next?

16 MR. BANCHS: Oh, ma'am, it's going to be Casey  
17 Ellis.

18 HEARING EXAMINER: Again just a statement, the  
19 rebuttal statement?

20 MR. BANCHS: Yes. They were not interviewed as  
21 part of the investigation.

22 HEARING EXAMINER: Okay. Would you raise your  
23 right hand, please? Do you swear or affirm that the  
24 testimony you're about to give in this case is the truth,  
25 the whole truth, and nothing but the truth so help you

1 God?

2 SERGEANT ELLIS: Yes, sir.

3 HEARING EXAMINER: You are also advised that  
4 you are assured the freedom from restraint, interference,  
5 discrimination, coercion, or reprisal for testifying in  
6 this case. And you may have a seat. Mr. Banchs?

7 MR. BANCHS: Thank you, sir.

8 SERGEANT CASEY ELLIS

9 (At 8:38 a.m., sworn as a witness, testified as follows)

10 DIRECT EXAMINATION

11 BY MR. BANCHS:

12 Q Good morning, Sergeant.

13 A **Good morning, sir.**

14 Q Can you tell us your rank, your name, and your current  
15 position both full time and MDA if you have a full-time  
16 position here at the Michigan National Guard?

17 A **Sure. Sergeant First Class Casey Ellis. On the full-time  
18 side, I'm ammunition and explosive handler here at Camp  
19 Grayling. And on the MDA side, I'm the HHD 272nd  
20 detachment section.**

21 Q And how long have you been in your full-time position?

22 A **Here at Grayling?**

23 Q Yes, sir.

24 A **2007.**

25 Q And how long have you been in the military?



1    **A**       **Since--well, 27 years, 1988.**

2    Q       Roger that. And, sir, how do you know Sergeant Reed?

3    **A**       **I met Sergeant Reed April, May 2012 when I joined the**  
4       **272nd. She was already in that unit.**

5    Q       Okay. And did you know her before that?

6    **A**       **No, I did not.**

7    Q       And then in your brief experience with Sergeant Reed--I  
8       mean, it's been a little over two years now--can you  
9       describe your general sense of who she as a person and as  
10      a soldier?

11   **A**       **Sure. I mean, she was my first-line leader when I joined**  
12      **the unit. And I mean, I was welcomed to the unit and, you**  
13      **know, I never had any issues with Sergeant Reed at all.**

14   Q       Okay. Now, as you may or may not be aware, the reason  
15      we're here is because Sergeant Reed was terminated from  
16      her full-time position as a technician. Are you aware of  
17      that, sir?

18   **A**       **Yes, sir.**

19   Q       Now, she was charged with a couple of things. But your  
20      testimony relates to her inappropriate use or alleged  
21      inappropriate use of government vehicles, whether they  
22      were GSAs or NTVs.

23   **A**       **Okay.**

24   Q       And if you don't mind, sir, you provided a statement--

25   **A**       **Sure.**

1 Q --on behalf of Sergeant Reed. If you don't mind reading  
2 that to yourself just to refresh your memory--

3 **A No. I have--**

4 Q You're good to go?

5 **A So, yeah.**

6 Q All right. So it's been alleged that Sergeant Reed, on a  
7 regular basis, used NTVs to attend--whether they were  
8 drill periods, AT on a consistent basis. And some--even  
9 some testimony has alluded to the fact that she even used  
10 NTVs every time she went to drill. The last time as--I  
11 guess it would be as early as last February of 2014, this  
12 year--

13 **A Okay.**

14 Q Okay. So can you--based on the statement that you gave us,  
15 can you in your own words--or whether you just want to  
16 read your statement--tell us what your experience is with  
17 seeing Sergeant Reed use or not use an NTV to come to  
18 drill?

19 **A Certainly. I've never seen Sergeant Reed at drill with an**  
20 **NTV. As I wrote in my statement, I know--I joined the**  
21 **unit--well, I actually joined the unit in April. My first**  
22 **drill with them wasn't until May, went on AT in June.**

23 **Now--**

24 Q Of 2012?

25 **A Of 2012. That year at AT there was an NTV that I was**

1 told--I mean, like I say, I was new to the unit, didn't  
2 really know anybody--that Master Sergeant Reed had  
3 acquired for the use of the unit and--

4 Q For AT?

5 A For AT purposes.

6 Q Roger that.

7 A The unit's based in Jackson, but we come to Grayling. So I  
8 mean, we were encouraged, you know, get with the Grayling  
9 people, they've got resources, you know, to help us  
10 complete our mission. And, you know, that's all that  
11 vehicle was used for.

12 Q So just to be clear--and this is a geographic issue. But  
13 the--for the AT period, the NTV that she secured was to  
14 use here?

15 A Exactly.

16 Q In the Grayling area?

17 A Exactly, right around Camp Grayling, so, yeah.

18 Q So just right really down the street from the MATES?

19 A Yeah. And we just used it for coming from the FOB. I know  
20 I rode it one night in to take a shower. You know, four or  
21 five people jump in and we came in and took a shower and  
22 went back to the FOB.

23 Q So you have seen her use an AT here in the Grayling  
24 area--I'm sorry--an NTV here in the Grayling area during  
25 that AT period?

1    **A**     **That AT period, yes.**

2    **Q**     Right. But as far as drill goes, since at least May of  
3           2012, you have--you do not recall ever seeing Sergeant  
4           Reed drive an NTV--

5    **A**     **No.**

6    **Q**     --to drill? Okay. And I want to be very specific. What's  
7           your--did you go to drill February of this year?

8    **A**     **I want to say I did but to be honest with you, unless I**  
9           **went back and looked at my LESES because I go to schools**  
10          **and stuff. But I'm quite sure I probably was, but without**  
11          **looking back, I wouldn't guarantee that I was there.**

12   **Q**     Okay. Well, then I won't--I won't ask you specifically. So  
13          we'll just leave it with this. In your recollection, she  
14          has not driven an NTV to drill since you've been there?

15   **A**     **That is correct, sir.**

16                   MR. BANCHS: I have no further questions for  
17                   this witness at this point.

18                   HEARING EXAMINER: Captain Bedells?

19                   CAPTAIN BEDELLS: No questions, sir.

20                   HEARING EXAMINER: I have one question, a very  
21                   simple one. How far is Jackson from here?

22                   THE WITNESS: From my house, it's about 200  
23                   miles, and I live 30 miles east of here. Two and a-half,  
24                   three hours roughly.

25                   HEARING EXAMINER: Okay, thanks. I'll remind

1           you that you remain under oath and that you are subject to  
2           recall to this hearing until such time that it has been  
3           adjourned. And I will also remind you not to discuss your  
4           testimony with anyone. With that, I thank you for your  
5           time here, and you're free to go.

6                         THE WITNESS: Thank you, sir.

7                         HEARING EXAMINER: Thanks.

8                         MAJOR JOHNSON: The next two are phone and  
9           call-in. We're going to have to set up that power comm.

10                        HEARING EXAMINER: Okay.

11                        MR. BANCHS: Do you want to take a break?

12                        MAJOR JOHNSON: Can we, please?

13                        HEARING EXAMINER: Let's go off the record.

14                        COURT REPORTER: It is 8:44 a.m. We are going  
15           off the record.

16                                 (Off the record)

17                        COURT REPORTER: We are going back on the  
18           record. The time is now 9:05 a.m.

19                        COLONEL PERRICANE: Hello?

20                        MAJOR JOHNSON: Colonel Perricane, it's Major  
21           Johnson. How are you doing?

22                        COLONEL PERRICANE: Fine, thank you.

23                        MAJOR JOHNSON: Good, sir. Hey, I've' got you  
24           on speakerphone here with hearing administrator, Colonel  
25           Dawkins, and the JAG and the Appellant, the

1 representative. Sir, I'll hand him to you.

2 HEARING EXAMINER: Colonel Perricane, this is  
3 Colonel Dawkins. I'm the Hearing Examiner in this case.  
4 I'm going to swear you in and then we've got both the  
5 Appellant and the Agency reps. Can you hear me okay?

6 COLONEL PERRICANE: Yes, sir.

7 HEARING EXAMINER: Okay. Both the Appellant's  
8 representative, who is Mr. Ben Banchs, and the Agency's  
9 representative, who is Captain Bedells, will ask you some  
10 questions. And then once they're done, it will come back  
11 to me and I'll sign you off. So if you would, do you swear  
12 or affirm that the testimony you're about to give in this  
13 case is the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the  
14 truth so help you God?

15 COLONEL PERRICANE: I do, sir.

16 HEARING EXAMINER: Okay. Further, you are  
17 advised that you are assured the freedom from restraint,  
18 interference, discrimination, coercion, or reprisal for  
19 testifying in this case. And I am going to turn you now  
20 over to Mr. Banchs who is Master Sergeant Renee Reed's  
21 representative in this case.

22 COLONEL PERRICANE: Okay, sir.

23 MR. BANCHS: Thank you, sir.

24 LIEUTENANT COLONEL MIKE PERRICANE

25 (At 9:06 a.m., sworn as a witness, testified as follows)

1 DIRECT EXAMINATION

2 BY MR. BANCHS:

3 Q Good morning, Colonel. How are you?

4 A I'm fine. Thank you.

5 Q Sir, we're only going to keep you for a brief moment. If  
6 you could, though, for the record, tell us your rank, your  
7 name, your full-time position, and your MDA position? If  
8 you could, sir?

9 A I'm Lieutenant Colonel Mike Perricane. My full-time  
10 position is--I'm a G8 civilian. I work at TACOM. And for  
11 MDA I'm currently the commander of the 1225th Combat  
12 (inaudible) Battalion. Prior to that I was with the 237th  
13 headquarters as both the executive officer and then as the  
14 GS3 and then as the executive officer.

15 Q Roger that. Thank you, sir. And as I'm sure you're aware,  
16 you're testifying in an appeal hearing--in an appeals  
17 hearing for Sergeant Renee Reed. Are you familiar with  
18 Sergeant Reed?

19 A Yes, I am.

20 Q Can you--can you share with us your interactions with  
21 Sergeant Reed either on a personal or on a professional  
22 basis and for how long you've been knowing her?

23 A Let's see. Probably when I was at the group headquarters,  
24 GS3. She joined the S3 section. So I think she  
25 was--probably worked for me as one of the--one of my

1           **senior NCOs for a year and probably the first year--or a**  
2           **year I was executive--so I think she was there for that**  
3           **time as well. I don't really know her outside of work,**  
4           **just worked, you know, with her on an MDA status for about**  
5           **two years.**

6    Q       Roger that, sir. And that's really what we're interested  
7           in, is your working with her in her MDA capacity for two  
8           years. And I'm assuming that that was for drills and ATs  
9           and things like that. Correct?

10   A       **Yes, sir.**

11   Q       Okay. Now, Sergeant Reed was terminated from her  
12           technician position for two charges. And the one that I'm  
13           interested in that you can perhaps provide some background  
14           on is the charge that she would--she misused nontactical  
15           vehicles to attend drill and AT. And if you could, sir--I  
16           know you provided a statement. You provided us a statement  
17           in support or in conjunction with our rebuttal on behalf  
18           of Master Sergeant Reed. Do you--do you have a copy of the  
19           statement with you?

20   A       **No. Do you happen to know what date it was? I could**  
21           **probably find it in a minute.**

22   Q       Yes, sir. The date on the--It's a DA form 28-23. And it's  
23           dated February 21st, 2014.

24   A       **Okay. It's coming up. Okay. I have it.**

25   Q       Do you need--if you need to read it, sir, you can just



1 read it to yourself. You can go right ahead, or if you're  
2 ready to proceed, just let me know.

3 A I'm ready.

4 Q Okay. Sir--

5 A I'll start with your basic question as far as going to IDT  
6 or drill weekends.

7 Q Yes, sir.

8 A I don't know what--I mean, I've never observed anything,  
9 but I don't see what everyone drives. So I can really talk  
10 to the--if there's an allegation of misuse during AT.

11 Q Okay, sir, you go right ahead.

12 A Okay. For Camp Grayling in 2012, our group was set up out  
13 in the south camp, you know, complete tactical moves for  
14 all the units, very small POV or GSA usage was allowed,  
15 really just for a few folks on the (inaudible) or folks  
16 that left early. The group--I think Lieutenant Colonel  
17 Golnick might have driven it over--was given access to a  
18 nontactical vehicle, a white SUV. And I don't know if  
19 Master Sergeant Reed made the call to Colonel Golnick to  
20 see if we could--to arrange it or--to be honest, I'm not  
21 quite sure how we got it initially. But as far as her  
22 getting it for anything to curry favor or any, like,  
23 assignment, I didn't see that. And as far as how the  
24 vehicle was used throughout the training, it was really  
25 used by the command group to get out to some of the units

1 in the training area without having to pull, you know,  
2 extra folks to drive in--drive in a Humvee because you  
3 know, that's a little under strength. So it wasn't--it  
4 wasn't around for personal--you know, used on personal  
5 errands or just joyriding around. And it wasn't, you know,  
6 under Sergeant Reed's control.

7 Q Roger that, sir. Okay. Well, thank you very much for  
8 that--for your recollection of that event. And, sir, since  
9 your interactions with Sergeant Reed have only really been  
10 on the MDA side, but you--you have been in a leadership  
11 role insofar as Sergeant Reed in the unit side. Would that  
12 be a correct statement?

13 A Yes.

14 Q And just, sir, your general impression of Sergeant Reed as  
15 a soldier and her capabilities and her duties?

16 A A strong NCO. She joined--I kind of--I didn't grow up in  
17 Michigan Guard. So I think--you know, I'm almost--six and  
18 a half years. But, you know, from the time she first  
19 reported in, I could--I'd go find the NCOs and say we need  
20 to get someone out to go, let's say, just observe  
21 training. And I don't want you to do any checklist. But  
22 she'd come back and have a very solid--you know, she  
23 operates very well on her own. She knows what right looks  
24 like. She works well with junior soldiers, always, you  
25 know, on time, physically fit, could make a decision, and

1           **very confident. I thought highly of her as an NCO and a**  
2           **leader.**

3    Q       Roger that, sir. Thank you very much. I don't have any  
4           further questions for you. I'm going to turn you over to  
5           Captain Bedells, who is the Agency representative. Thank  
6           you.

7    A       **Okay. Thank you.**

8                       HEARING EXAMINER: Captain Bedells?

9                       CAPTAIN BEDELLS: I don't have any questions.  
10           Thank you.

11                      HEARING EXAMINER: Okay. Colonel Perricane, I  
12           think we're finished here. So let me just read this to  
13           you. I'll remind you that you remain under oath and that  
14           you are subject to recall to this hearing until such time  
15           that it has been adjourned. I also remind you not to  
16           discuss your testimony with anyone.

17                      THE WITNESS: Roger; understood.

18                      HEARING EXAMINER: And with that, I thank you  
19           for your time, and you're free to go.

20                      THE WITNESS: Okay. Thank you, Colonel.

21                      HEARING EXAMINER: Thanks.

22                      MR. BANCHS: Thank you.

23                      (At 9:13 a.m., witness excused)

24                      HEARING EXAMINER: Is it Ruby?

25                      MR. BANCHS: Yes, sir, Major now Jeremy Ruby.

1 MAJOR JOHNSON: Do you want me to call him or  
2 HEARING EXAMINER: You ready?  
3 MR. BANCHS: Yes, sir. We're ready.  
4 MAJOR RUBY: Hello?  
5 MAJOR JOHNSON: Major Ruby, it's Johnson.  
6 MAJOR RUBY: How are you doing today?  
7 MAJOR JOHNSON: Good. Hey, I've got you on  
8 speakerphone here with the hearing administrator, Colonel  
9 Dawkins, and the rest of the staff. I'll turn you over to  
10 them.  
11 MAJOR RUBY: Thank you.  
12 HEARING EXAMINER: Major Ruby, this is Colonel  
13 Dawkins. Good morning.  
14 MAJOR RUBY: Good morning, sir.  
15 HEARING EXAMINER: Can you hear us okay?  
16 MAJOR RUBY: I can hear you fine.  
17 HEARING EXAMINER: Okay. I'm going to swear  
18 you in. Let's go ahead and take care of that first, then  
19 I'll just kind of briefly let you know how this is going  
20 to go. Do you swear or affirm that the testimony you're  
21 about to give in this case is the truth, the whole truth,  
22 and nothing but the truth so help you God?  
23 MAJOR RUBY: I do.  
24 HEARING EXAMINER: Okay. Further, you are  
25 advised that you are assured the freedom from restraint,

1 interference, discrimination, coercion, or reprisal for  
2 testifying in this case.

3 MAJOR RUBY: I am.

4 HEARING EXAMINER: The way we're going to  
5 proceed--I don't think this is going to take very long.  
6 But I'm going to--there are two representatives. Master  
7 Sergeant Reed's representative is Mr. Ben Banchs. He's  
8 going to ask you some questions. And then Captain Bedells  
9 is representing the Agency in this case, and he's going to  
10 ask you some questions. So I'm going to go ahead and turn  
11 it over to Mr. Banchs to begin with.

12 MAJOR RUBY: Okay. Thank you, sir.

13 MAJOR JEREMY RUBY

14 (At 9:15 a.m., sworn as a witness, testified as follows)

15 DIRECT EXAMINATION

16 BY MR. BANCHS:

17 Q Good morning, sir. How are you?

18 A **Doing all right, Mr. Banchs.**

19 Q All right. Sir, I'm going to ask you just a couple of  
20 housekeeping questions. If you could, tell us your rank,  
21 your full name, your current full-time position, and your  
22 current MDA position for the record.

23 A **Okay. My name's Major Jeremy Ruby. I currently work full  
24 time for (inaudible) down in Fort Custer. And my MDA  
25 position is up in Grayling as the deputy director of**

1 (inaudible).

2 Q Roger that, sir. And how long have you held both MDA and  
3 your full-time position?

4 A Full-time position I just started last week officially.  
5 Prior to that I worked as a supervisor for FMS4 for eight  
6 years. And MDA-wise, I've been up there at the MTC for  
7 about a year and a half.

8 Q Roger that. And can you--now, you know that you're  
9 currently testifying in an appeals hearing on behalf  
10 of--not on behalf of but in support of Master Sergeant  
11 Renee Reed. Can you tell us your interactions with  
12 Sergeant Reed, how long you've known her both  
13 professionally and personally?

14 A On the full-time side, I probably had brief interactions  
15 since she worked at MATES probably for the last five, six  
16 years. And then my interactions were in the 272nd when I  
17 was there for approximately a year and a half, almost two  
18 years.

19 Q Roger that. Now, speaking to your interactions with her as  
20 a technician, did you interact with her in her capacity as  
21 a production controller?

22 A That's correct. It was just our--if my shop needed to  
23 do--you know, access transactions or get parts or stuff  
24 like that, that's generally how--or if we needed help with  
25 credit card stuff. Those are probably the minimal things

1           **that I had interactions with her on.**

2    Q       Did she help you create any kind of SOPs or anything like  
3           that?

4    A       **On the MDA side, yes.**

5    Q       Okay. Can you describe those?

6    A       **Oh, we worked together extensively on physical security,  
7           written SOP--no actual doing--going around and doing  
8           inspections type of stuff, more stuff--**

9    Q       Roger that, sir. Now, turning your attention to the MDA  
10           side of the house, I'm not--I'm not sure whether you're  
11           aware of not, but obviously Sergeant Reed was terminated.  
12           And she was terminated for two different charges. And the  
13           one that I want to get your testimony on is the  
14           allegations that she misused NTVs or GSAs, that she  
15           inappropriately used these types of government assets. Do  
16           you recall providing a sworn statement on behalf of or in  
17           support of our answer on behalf of Sergeant Reed?

18   A       **Yes.**

19   Q       Okay. Do you have that statement in front of you, sir?

20   A       **I do not. I'm at home. I have a newborn that I'm trying to  
21           help take care of.**

22   Q       Roger that. And we're going to speed this up as much as we  
23           can, because we know that you are, you know--you're the  
24           proud new father. So do you need me to refresh your memory  
25           on what you--on what you wrote? Or are you okay--

1    **A**    I'm clear on--because there's only a couple instances that  
2           I reference. One reference was providing--she used an NTV  
3           in her MDA status and that was to pick up parts, large  
4           parts from my shop to hers. I think there was a tire and  
5           then some boxes. And I don't think that was a misuse  
6           because her taking it there--having to fit that stuff in  
7           her small vehicle, personal vehicle and then doing that on  
8           the MDA status saved both the organizations money because  
9           it--you know, going from Jackson to--since she was going  
10          to Jackson anyway and picking up stuff for Wyoming rather  
11          than sending somebody on the road for a mission that would  
12          have to have been done anyway. So--and then AT, the  
13          organization had use of an NTV from MATES, and it wasn't  
14          her personal vehicle. The whole organization had use of it  
15          so I know that people in the section used it extensively.  
16          I knew that the brigade XO used it. I know the commander's  
17          driver used it to move around the brigade--or the troop  
18          commander. So it wasn't her--for her personal use.

19    **Q**    Roger that, sir. Thank you very much for your  
20           recollection. Now, we're going to wrap it up here real  
21           quick. Since you knew Sergeant Reed both on the MDA and  
22           the civilian side, I'm going to ask you a couple of  
23           questions. First off, what was your impression of Sergeant  
24           Reed as a technician in her PC capacity?

25    **A**    Well, the brief period actually that I had, you know, as



1 far as technician stuff goes, they were all professional.  
2 She helped out. She provided the support that my shop  
3 needed. I think she did some liaison work for the 1032nd  
4 when I was a commander there and helped up with the clerks  
5 a little bit. But it was positive, highly professional.

6 Q Roger that. And then in your role as a leader in her MDA  
7 side, would it be the same characterization?

8 A Yeah, definitely. She did things that were outside of her  
9 scope. She provided help in the 92 period in training and  
10 then she did stuff that wasn't typical--which was not part  
11 of her normal duties. No problems with her--she was--we  
12 worked the battle stats together and she worked directly  
13 underneath me for (inaudible)and she performed  
14 outstandingly.

15 Q Roger that, sir. Sir, I want to thank you for your time,  
16 and I'm going to turn you over to the Agency  
17 representative, Captain Bedells. Thank you.

18 A Okay. Thank you.

19 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: The only question I have is  
20 how's the other Major Ruby doing?

21 THE WITNESS: She's doing great and the baby's  
22 doing awesome. And we're pretty happy parents.

23 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Great. That's all I have.  
24 Thanks.

25 THE WITNESS: Well, that was quick. I

1 appreciate that, Captain Bedells.

2 HEARING EXAMINER: Major Ruby, this is Colonel  
3 Dawkins again. I'll remind you that you remain under oath  
4 and that you are subject to recall to this hearing until  
5 such time that it has been adjourned. I also remind you  
6 please do not discuss your testimony with anyone.

7 THE WITNESS: Not a problem, sir. And I  
8 appreciate the ability to do this call in.

9 HEARING EXAMINER: Okay. And we thank you for  
10 your time.

11 THE WITNESS: Okay. Thank you.

12 HEARING EXAMINER: Can we go off the record.

13 COURT REPORTER: We are going off the record.  
14 The time is 9:23 a.m.

15 (At 9:23 a.m., witness excused)

16 (Off the record)

17 COURT REPORTER: We are back on the record.  
18 The time is now 9:25 a.m.

19 HEARING EXAMINER: Do you swear or affirm that  
20 the testimony you're about to give in this case is the  
21 truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth so help  
22 you God?

23 MASTER SERGEANT SHELDON: Yes, sir.

24 HEARING EXAMINER: Okay. Further, you are  
25 advised that you are assured the freedom from restraint,

1 interference, discrimination, coercion, or reprisal for  
2 testifying in this case.

3 MASTER SERGEANT SHELDON: Yes, sir.

4 HEARING EXAMINER: You may have a seat. Mr.  
5 Banchs?

6 MR. BANCHS: Thank you, sir.

7 MASTER SERGEANT TIMOTHY SHELDON

8 (At 9:25 a.m., sworn as a witness, testified as follows)

9 DIRECT EXAMINATION

10 BY MR. BANCHS:

11 Q Good morning, Sergeant Sheldon.

12 A **Good morning.**

13 Q I know you testified last week, but just for the record,  
14 can you refresh our memory, full name, your rank obviously  
15 and then your full-time position and MDA position?

16 A **Master Sergeant Timothy Sheldon. I work at the MATES as  
17 the armorer.**

18 Q And how long have you been there?

19 A **I've been there 16 years.**

20 Q And then as an MDA?

21 A **Thirty-two years.**

22 Q Roger that. This is fairly quick, sir. I'm just going to  
23 ask you a couple questions. How long have you been knowing  
24 Sergeant Reed for?

25 A **I'd say at least 10, 12 years, somewhere in there.**

1 Q Okay. And those interactions, are they professional, are  
2 they personal, or are they both?

3 A **Kind of both.**

4 Q Okay. And can you describe your--what are your  
5 work-related interactions with Sergeant Reed?

6 A **Sergeant Reed would always help me out with all my time  
7 sheets and stuff like that. I always had my timesheet  
8 screwed up, so she was the one who always get me out of a  
9 jam. Or if I ever needed a question, I always went to  
10 Sergeant Reed for anything to do with the parts part and  
11 her--**

12 Q All right. And in your interactions with her, would you  
13 happen to go in the office at all--in her office at all?

14 A **I was in there quite a bit actually.**

15 Q Okay. And now some--I'm sure as you know Sergeant Reed was  
16 terminated--

17 A **Yes.**

18 Q --for two specific charges, one for an inappropriate  
19 relationship with Colonel Golnick and the other one for  
20 misuses of--for misuse of a nontactical vehicle--

21 A **Yes.**

22 Q --inappropriate use.

23 A **Yes.**

24 Q So we're going to address both of them really quick. Now,  
25 when you say that you were in her office a lot, just give

1 me an idea on a daily basis.

2 **A I'd say a couple times a day.**

3 Q A couple times--

4 **A Two or three times a day.**

5 Q And when you would go in there, would Colonel Golnick in

6 there? Yes, no or--

7 **A Not all the time, no.**

8 Q Not all the time?

9 **A No.**

10 Q And the times that he was in there, what was the

11 atmosphere or the interactions like between him and her or

12 even yourself?

13 **A Usually always a work-related-type thing.**

14 Q Now, some people have described the relationship or the

15 alleged relationship they were having as inappropriate.

16 What would your view of that relationship be?

17 **A I didn't think it was inappropriate at all.**

18 Q And what do you base your opinion on?

19 **A As in just usually every time I was in there, they were**

20 **usually talking about work of some sort.**

21 Q Okay. Now, as far as her inappropriate uses of nontactical

22 vehicles, what is your experience with MATES personnel

23 having access to or using nontactical vehicles?

24 **A I used to use it going to drill myself.**

25 Q Can you describe that situation?

1    **A**       Well, it was--we'd always--because we drilled down in  
2           Lansing, so there'd be about two or three of us that would  
3           take the HHR down to Lansing or to Battle Creek, depending  
4           on--I mean, there for a while they put a stop to it after  
5           a while. But we used to use it quite a bit.

6    **Q**       Now, when you say after a while, when did it stop?

7    **A**       I'd say around a year ago, somewhere in there, year and a  
8           half.

9    **Q**       Was it your impression that it was because of this  
10          investigation, or did something else change?

11   **A**       I think it was--a lot of it was the investigation.

12   **Q**       Okay. So prior to the vehicle usage being stopped, was it  
13          because it was inappropriate? Or was it just because--

14   **A**       No. I don't know if it was just a money thing or what it  
15          was.

16   **Q**       Roger that. In her work capacity--and everybody that's  
17          testified so far--I'm talking everybody--has talked about  
18          the fact that Renee is either one of the best or the best  
19          PC in this state.

20   **A**       I would agree with that 100 percent.

21   **Q**       Okay. And why would you say that, just real quick?  
22          Curious.

23   **A**       She always had answers for anything I ever--any question I  
24          ever had.

25   **Q**       Now, obviously you testified last week, and you're



1 BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:  
2 Q I do, Master Sergeant Sheldon. I'm looking through this  
3 15-6. Did you provide a sworn statement?  
4 **A No.**  
5 Q You didn't provide a sworn statement at all?  
6 **A No.**  
7 Q So you didn't tell the investigating officer any of what  
8 you've told us here today?  
9 **A As in writing one down?**  
10 Q No. The question was you didn't--did you tell the  
11 investigating officer anything you've told us here today?  
12 **A Yeah.**  
13 Q You did?  
14 **A Uh-huh.**  
15 Q Okay. Was it in an interview?  
16 **A It was an interview.**  
17 Q So in the interview, you told him about your NTV--the fact  
18 that you had used an NTV?  
19 **A I did; I did.**  
20 Q Okay. But you didn't put it in a sworn statement?  
21 **A I never wrote a sworn statement. I never was asked.**  
22 Q And did--  
23 **A As a matter of fact I just saw an NTV used three**  
24 **nights--or two weeks ago by a Major and a Warrant Officer**  
25 **for drill.**



1 Q Okay. Did you tell the investigating officer about your  
2 interactions in Master Sergeant Reed's office?

3 A **I did.**

4 Q And you told him that you didn't view it as inappropriate  
5 whatsoever?

6 A **No.**

7 Q And that every time you were in there--well, first of all,  
8 I presume you told him that Lieutenant Colonel Golnick was  
9 rarely in there when you went in there. Is that correct?

10 A **I never said that, "rarely" was in there.**

11 Q Okay. Well, what did you say, because I was only half  
12 paying attention. What did you tell Mr. Banchs?

13 A **About what? When--**

14 Q When you went in to Master Sergeant Reed's, how often  
15 would you find Lieutenant Colonel Golnick in there?

16 A **He wasn't in there all the time that I was in there  
17 because I walked by there all the time. It was--**

18 Q So if it wasn't rare--

19 A **--on my way to the office.**

20 Q If it wasn't rarely, how would you characterize it?

21 A **I don't know what you mean.**

22 Q Okay. Well, if he wasn't always in there--

23 A **Right.**

24 Q --and you're telling me it wasn't that he was rarely in  
25 there--

1    **A**       **He wasn't in there every single time I walked by there.**

2    Q        Okay. Would you say half the time?

3    **A**       **No.**

4    Q        A third of the time?

5    **A**       **It wasn't my job to keep tabs on him and see when he was**  
6            **in there.**

7    Q        I get that. So would it be fair to say less than half the  
8            time?

9    **A**       **Less than half the time.**

10   Q        Okay. And I--

11   **A**       **It was a few times a day, I would say, that I'd seen him**  
12            **in there.**

13   Q        But I was paying attention--

14   **A**       **But not every day.**

15   Q        Right. Let me just finish my question. I was paying  
16            attention when I think you heard--you told Mr. Banchs that  
17            when you were in there, they were always talking about  
18            business.

19   **A**       **I might have said that, but it--I wouldn't say it was**  
20            **always talking about business, but half the time I wasn't**  
21            **paying attention to what they were talking about.**

22                    CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Okay. I don't have any  
23            further questions, sir.

24                    HEARING EXAMINER: Redirect?

25                    MR. BANCHS: Briefly.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

REDIRECT EXAMINATION

BY MR. BANCHS:

Q The times that they weren't talking about business, what would they be talking about?

**A I don't remember now what it would have been, just--**

Q Well, then I'll ask you in your--in your personal experience with your coworkers, whether they're higher ranking, whether they're lower ranking, are your conversations with those individuals always about work?

**A Never about--hardly ever about work when I--**

Q So what are you talking about--so what do you talk about with your coworkers regardless of--

**A Yeah.**

Q --rank?

**A It's usually hunting or fishing or something like that.**

Q Football?

**A What'd you do last night or whatever, Green Bay Packers.**

Q Roger that. Sir, refresh my memory of what is your job?

**A I'm the armorer.**

Q You're the armorer?

**A Yes.**

Q And just describe briefly what you do with the armorer?

**A Work on weapons.**

Q You work on weapons?

**A Yes.**

1 Q So as you're working, you work on M-16s--  
2 A **M-16s or whatever, yeah.**  
3 Q So as you're working on an M-16, you might be talking  
4 about good or bad, how the Lions or the Packers did last  
5 night?  
6 A **Right; correct.**  
7 Q And is that something strange?  
8 A **Or where are you hunting tonight or tomorrow or whatever.**  
9 Q Is there anything wrong with that?  
10 A **Nothing wrong with that.**  
11 MR. BANCHS: Thank you, sir.  
12 HEARING EXAMINER: Recross?  
13 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: No, sir.  
14 HEARING EXAMINER: All right. Sergeant  
15 Sheldon, I'll remind you that you remain under oath and  
16 that you are subject to recall to this hearing until such  
17 time that it has been adjourned. Further I remind you not  
18 to discuss your testimony with anyone.  
19 THE WITNESS: Yes, sir.  
20 HEARING EXAMINER: And with that, you're free  
21 to go.  
22 THE WITNESS: Thank you, sir.  
23 HEARING EXAMINER: Thank you for your time.  
24 COURT REPORTER: We are going off the record  
25 at 9:34 a.m.

1 (At 9:34 a.m., witness excused)

2 (Off the record)

3 COURT REPORTER: We are back on the record.

4 The time is now 9:40 a.m.

5 HEARING EXAMINER: Do you swear or affirm that  
6 the testimony you're about to give in this case is the  
7 truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth so help  
8 you God?

9 MR. REED: I do.

10 HEARING EXAMINER: Further, you are advised  
11 that you are assured the freedom from restraint,  
12 interference, discrimination, coercion, or reprisal for  
13 testifying in this case.

14 MR. REED: Okay.

15 HEARING EXAMINER: You can have a seat,  
16 please. Mr. Banchs?

17 MR. BANCHS: Thank you, sir.

18 JAMES REED

19 (At 9:40 a.m., sworn as a witness, testified as follows)

20 DIRECT EXAMINATION

21 BY MR. BANCHS:

22 Q Good morning, Mr. Reed. Sir, if you could for the record,  
23 state your full name and--are you retired now from the  
24 military?

25 A Yes.

1 Q So your former rank or your retired rank and then your  
2 current full-time position and what you did--what you used  
3 to do as an MDA.

4 A Okay. James Jason Reed, retired CW3. I, as an MDA soldier,  
5 was the DOEM or G6 for Camp Grayling, the director for the  
6 6 shop. And currently as a fed tech, I'm a GS12, and I'm  
7 the LAN manager for the 6 shop down on JFHQ.

8 Q And how long were you in the military, sir?

9 A Twenty-eight years.

10 Q And did you do computers the whole time?

11 A I started out in the maintenance arena for about the first  
12 three-ish, four years. And then in the late 80s, early  
13 90s, when computers started to come in, they realized I  
14 was one of those people. And they moved me into the  
15 computer arena. So I've been in computers for 25 years.

16 Q And when you say maintenance, you mean vehicle  
17 maintenance?

18 A Basically tool and parts. I was like the supply guy--

19 Q Roger that.

20 A --working in FMS shop over in Montague and Grand Rapids.

21 Q Okay. And then so you never worked at the MATES?

22 A No.

23 Q But your--how long have you been working here at Camp  
24 Grayling?

25 A I've been at--well, I was in Lansing for about 12 years.

1 I've been in Grayling for about 11 years now. And my  
2 current duty position that I took as a civilian is back  
3 down in Lansing. But it entails taking care of networks  
4 all across the state, so I travel most of the time.

5 Q Now, understanding you guys are married, but how long have  
6 you been knowing Renee?

7 A I think we met in 2001. It was here at Camp Grayling, so  
8 it's--it's been 13-ish years.

9 Q And when you guys met in 2001, was that--was that  
10 work-related or was that socially? How did that--

11 A It was socially.

12 Q It was socially?

13 A She was working down at the recreation area down here at  
14 Camp Grayling. And I happened to be up here doing some  
15 work at that time. I was still living in Lansing. And we  
16 met socially.

17 Q Okay. And then how long have you all been married now?

18 A Nine years.

19 Q Nine years. So the majority of the time that she's been  
20 working at the MATES, you guys have been married?

21 A Correct.

22 Q And then Colonel Golnick or Chris Golnick, how long have  
23 you been knowing him and what's your relationship with  
24 him? Was it professional or personal?

25 A I met him professionally probably around 2003-ish, 2004,

1           because with my job obviously there's computer networks at  
2           MATES. So there was work to be done. I met him at that  
3           point as the shop supervisor. Probably around 2007, 2008,  
4           he on the MDA side was assigned to range control. So with  
5           me being on the MDA side here, he was at that point  
6           assigned as my rater. So we got to get a little more  
7           acquainted and probably for the last five, six years,  
8           we've been pretty close friends since then.

9    Q       Roger that. Now, I know you wrote a pretty detailed  
10       statement and I'm sure you're painfully aware of the  
11       circumstances surrounding the investigation and your  
12       wife's determination because she was--although she was  
13       never made an official respondent, she was definitely one  
14       of the focal points and at some point in time she became--

15    A       **Yeah.**

16    Q       --and I'm sure that you had numerous conversations with  
17       her. So what I'm going to do is I'm just going to give you  
18       an opportunity to present not necessarily your side of the  
19       story but what your impression of all this is and your  
20       feelings on it.

21    A       **On the portion with my wife?**

22    Q       Yes, sir. But, you know, if you want to take it by the  
23       numbers, you can speak to the inappropriate relationship  
24       and her--and alleged misuse of NTVs. And if you want to  
25       expound on anything, you more than welcome, sir.



1                   CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Well, I'm going to--before  
2                   he starts, I'm going to place an objection, sir. Now, I  
3                   didn't object when Master Sergeant Herblet went clearly  
4                   outside the scope of what's in evidence because I don't  
5                   believe a word that comes out that guy's mouth, frankly.  
6                   But I know--I know former Chief Reed to be a good guy. And  
7                   what I want to do is I don't--there was no witness  
8                   synopsis provided. I asked for it. What we got was he's a  
9                   material witness and this is his statement. So I'm going  
10                  to place an objection to him going outside anything that's  
11                  written in this statement. I don't--I don't know what else  
12                  he's going to testify to.

13                  MR. BANCHS: I don't think he's going to go  
14                  outside of the statement.

15                  CAPTAIN BEDELLS: He is if you're going to  
16                  talk about NTVs and inappropriate relationship, because  
17                  that's not--that's not talked about in here. What he talks  
18                  about is Grayling as being a small town and everyone  
19                  working together and so on and so forth. So that's what  
20                  we've been provided notice of, and that's what we expected  
21                  him to testify to. If he testifies to that, I have no  
22                  objection. But going outside of that, like Master Sergeant  
23                  Sheldon did--and I didn't say anything--I'm going to--I  
24                  have an objection to.

25                  MR. BANCHS: Well, sir, Master Sergeant

1 Reed--I'm sorry--Chief Reed is not necessarily here as a  
2 material witness. He's here as a character reference. And  
3 what more of a character reference could you get but the  
4 employee's spouse. So he's going to--and I don't  
5 understand where Captain Bedells is coming from, because  
6 if the Chief's statement doesn't go to the inappropriate  
7 relationship, I don't know what does. I mean, not--he  
8 doesn't deny knowing the Colonel, so I mean, I would--I  
9 would say it's her husband. I would think that he would  
10 get the opportunity to present his side of the story and  
11 his impression of whether the relationship was  
12 inappropriate or not.

13 HEARING EXAMINER: What's your question? What  
14 did you just ask him again?

15 MR. BANCHS: I really just wanted to expound  
16 on the statement that he provided. I might not have said  
17 "statement," I don't expect him to say anything different  
18 than he's already said in here.

19 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: And he said nothing about  
20 NTV use, and he said nothing about the relationship at  
21 work, and presumably because he's not there. It's  
22 understandable. He doesn't work at MATES, so he doesn't  
23 know what's going on there.

24 MR. BANCHS: Okay. He has been a member of the  
25 Michigan National Guard for how long?

1 THE WITNESS: Twenty-eight years.

2 MR. BANCHS: Okay. So I'm sure that he's not  
3 unfamiliar with GSA and NTV use. And I'm sure his wife  
4 told him that she was allegedly accused of misusing NTVs.  
5 So he doesn't have to speak to the facts of the case, but  
6 he can certainly speak to what his impressions are of the  
7 allegations against her. He is not some guy off the street  
8 that doesn't know anything about the military.

9 HEARING EXAMINER: I'm interested in  
10 hearing--this witness obviously has intimate knowledge of  
11 his wife's impression of what was going on at work in  
12 terms of the relationship with her and Colonel Golnick.  
13 I'm interested in that.

14 MR. BANCHS: Obviously.

15 HEARING EXAMINER: I would prefer that you ask  
16 questions though rather than just opening it up, and  
17 partly just for the sake of time.

18 MR. BANCHS: Okay. No worries. Well, then I'll  
19 ask it a different way.

20 HEARING EXAMINER: Yeah, the NTV stuff,  
21 there's no doubt in my mind they discussed what was going  
22 on. But he would have no idea what--you know, officially  
23 how that worked and the processes and stuff--

24 MR. BANCHS: Yeah. I'm not going to get into  
25 specifics with that. I'm just going to ask him for his

1 impressions of the charge--

2 HEARING EXAMINER: Yeah. But I am definitely  
3 interested in his impression of what she shared with--what  
4 Master Sergeant Reed shared with him in terms of the  
5 relationship.

6 MR. BANCHS: Roger. I'll--

7 HEARING EXAMINER: Does that make--

8 MR. BANCHS: Yeah.

9 HEARING EXAMINER: Okay.

10 BY MR. BANCHS:

11 Q So I'll ask it a different way, sir. Obviously you know  
12 that your wife was fired for allegedly having an  
13 inappropriate relationship with Colonel Golnick. Do you  
14 believe the allegations?

15 A **Absolutely not.**

16 Q And why is that?

17 A **Because we're friends.**

18 Q And when you say "we're friends"--

19 A **Myself, Chris Golnick, my wife, you know. And there's--and**  
20 **it goes way beyond that but again to keep it within the**  
21 **scope of this, Chris and I have become very close friends**  
22 **over the years. He's helped with different projects at my**  
23 **house. I've helped him with different projects. It's kind**  
24 **of the way--as I put in my statement, the way we do things**  
25 **in small communities. You develop these relationships and**

- 1           you become friends. So the fact that Chris was at my house  
2           or our house quite a bit helping me with a lot of  
3           projects--I'm not a handyman. I'm a computer guy. So I'm  
4           not good at building walls and hanging drywall and things  
5           of that nature. So he came over and helped, and in the  
6           process over the course of the years we developed, all of  
7           us, very close relationships. So in my opinion--again,  
8           it's just an opinion. You know, to get fired because  
9           you're friends with somebody, I don't--I don't get it.
- 10    Q       Now, I'm sure because Renee had a copy of the 15-6 because  
11           you know everything that was provided to us was provided  
12           to you guys.
- 13    A       **Correct.**
- 14    Q       Have you had an opportunity to review it?
- 15    A       **Yes.**
- 16    Q       Okay. And based on the statements that were being  
17           made--I'll ask you this. Was there anything in there that  
18           surprised you or that took you aback in a negative way?
- 19    A       **Not in a--there was some things that surprised me like  
20           more of I couldn't believe some of the things were being  
21           said or the allegations that were being made, because they  
22           were ridiculous.**
- 23    Q       Did any of the allegations that you're--and granted,  
24           everybody stopped short of alleging that they were having  
25           a sexual relationship. But they certainly alluded to it,

1 at least in my reading of it. Did you--did that cause you  
2 any problems?

3 **A No, because I knew it wasn't true.**

4 **Q** Did you ever have any doubts as to what the relationship  
5 between Chris Golnick and your wife was?

6 **A Never once.**

7 **Q** Now, it has been testified to that he was in her office by  
8 some accounts a lot. You know, some--you know, whether it  
9 was between two hours a day to the worst case scenario  
10 which is seven and one-half hours out of an eight-hour  
11 day.

12 **A Right.**

13 **Q** Okay? And that they were in there talking about all manner  
14 of subjects, whether they were work-related or  
15 nonwork-related. Did that give you any cause for concern?

16 **A No.**

17 **Q** Okay. Now, when you say that you and Colonel Golnick hang  
18 out a lot, I'm assuming that it's outside of work?

19 **A Correct.**

20 **Q** And that he's helped you build stuff on your property, and  
21 you've helped him with--what kind of stuff have you helped  
22 him with?

23 **A Usually it's other projects, not necessarily at my house,  
24 but other friends' houses. There's--I can't think of his  
25 name right now. Jay Hawkins, we helped him build a pole**

1           barn. QR Mason, (phonetic), we helped him build a pole  
2           barn. There is several other people that we've all been  
3           together and doing other projects. It's--like I said, it's  
4           kind of what we do.

5    Q       Now, let me ask you this. Is Chris Golnick the only  
6           Lieutenant Colonel or senior ranking officer that you have  
7           a close relationship with?

8    A       No.

9    Q       Who'd be another officer that you would have a close  
10          relationship with?

11   A       Retired or currently active?

12   Q       Either one.

13   A       Colonel Gary McConnell (phonetic), he was a post  
14          commander. He's a very close--he and his wife are very  
15          close friends of ours. Colonel Steve Barner (phonetic),  
16          he's retired Chief of Staff USPF0. He held several  
17          positions. He and his wife, Roseann, we've done things  
18          with them. They have a cabin up in the U.P. We've been to  
19          their cabin before. And literally we could sit here for an  
20          hour and I could list other names.

21   Q       The relationships that you've had with these  
22          individuals--and you know what, I won't limit it to higher  
23          ranking individuals. I'm sure you guys have relationships  
24          with lower ranking individuals.

25   A       Absolutely.

1 Q Have these relationships ever been fostered because you  
2 were trying to get something out of somebody, curry  
3 special favor?

4 A No.

5 Q The investigating officer, Colonel Doolittle himself,  
6 testified that he's been to your house.

7 A Yes.

8 Q Can you--can you describe that visit or those visits? How  
9 many times--

10 A At one point in time Colonel Doolittle and I were close  
11 friends. We hung out quite a bit when he would come up  
12 here. I think at that time he was probably a Captain. But  
13 it--during AT periods we would have social gatherings at  
14 the house, barbecues and things. And there would be  
15 several people, officers and enlisted, out at the house.

16 Q Who else at the MATES do you and your wife have close  
17 relationships with--close relationships with other than  
18 Colonel Golnick?

19 A Colonel Golnick, Mike McNamara, at one point Joel Mack,  
20 Troy Herblet, Troy Mason, Ed Palmer (phonetic). And again,  
21 we can sit here and go on and on. There's several.

22 Q So the interactions between Colonel Golnick and your wife  
23 were not unique to just Colonel Golnick and your wife per  
24 se?

25 A No.



1 Q I mean, this is something that you guys--I don't want to  
2 put words in your mouth. But as you described in your  
3 statement, it's a small-town feel?

4 A **Correct.**

5 Q Now, you do--understanding that we're in the military and  
6 that the military have--the military has--certain  
7 regulations put restrictions on the types of relationships  
8 that we can have in between the ranks.

9 A **Right.**

10 Q How do you square with that in this setting?

11 A **In this setting, we're technicians, so that the separation  
12 between technicians and military personnel--granted we are  
13 all or were in the military. But as federal technicians,  
14 it's kind of a gray area between the military and the fed  
15 tech side. And, again, when you--as a fed tech/military  
16 person, when you spend eight, ten, multiple hours a day  
17 with this group of people, you deploy with these people.  
18 These people defend your life, and you defend their lives.  
19 Of course you're going to develop personal relationships  
20 that maybe go outside the scope of certain things.**

21 Q Sir, I don't want to say your testimony is biased because  
22 I do believe what you said. Okay? And obviously if you  
23 would have had a reason to--well, you know, I'll ask it a  
24 different way. Has this--has this investigation had any  
25 kind of effect, good or bad, on your marriage?

1    **A**     It's put a strain on our marriage, financial strain, you  
2           know, obviously. You know, I've had to sit and watch my  
3           wife goes through this hell and very undeserving in my  
4           opinion. Obviously it has put somewhat of a strain and  
5           sometimes more than others. But, you know, as husband and  
6           wife, that's what you do. You get through these things.  
7           But, yeah, it's been a rough patch for a while.

8    **Q**     Again, knowing--predicting your answer, do you  
9           believe--did you at any point have any reason to believe  
10          the allegations that were made against your wife?

11   **A**     **Never.**

12   **Q**     Whether it was an inappropriate relationship or misuse of  
13          GSAs?

14   **A**     **No.**

15   **Q**     And then obviously do you think she should have been  
16          fired?

17   **A**     **No.**

18   **Q**     Okay. And then what is your relationship with Colonel  
19          Golnick like now?

20   **A**     It's the same yet different. He--he still comes out to the  
21          house, and he still helps with things. And, you know, we  
22          still hang out, but I think he feels somewhat responsible,  
23          you know, for a lot of the things that have happened. So  
24          there's a little difference, but we--we still do things  
25          together. We still hang out. We're still friends.

1 MR. BANCHS: I think I have--I think that's  
2 all I have for now, Chief. Thank you very much for your  
3 testimony. I'll turn it over to Captain Bedells.

4 CROSS-EXAMINATION

5 BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

6 Q I'm curious, Chief. Just one question. You said that you  
7 think that Lieutenant Colonel Golnick feels responsible.  
8 Has he told you that he felt--feels responsible in some  
9 way?

10 A No, not straight out.

11 Q Okay. Well, in any way, has he told you that?

12 A I really--I think at one point he did say that he felt  
13 responsible. I don't think he actually put it as "it was  
14 my fault." I think he put it as, you know, "I feel  
15 responsible for what's happened."

16 Q And he told you that?

17 A Yes.

18 Q Did you ask him, hey--he's your friend--"Hey, Chris, how  
19 do you feel responsible"? Did you ask him that? Or was it  
20 just understood?

21 A It was more of a, "Hey, this is all BS. We all know." You  
22 know, we've discussed it, you know, amongst ourselves. And  
23 I said, "Don't worry about it. You know, we're friends."  
24 And I don't want to get too far off track, but we all have  
25 our own opinions on how this investigation went. And I

1           guess the fact, without being too blunt that it was BS,  
2           and he shouldn't feel responsible because of the fact of  
3           the way things were handled or inappropriately handled in  
4           my opinion.

5    Q       Do you hold him responsible in any respect?

6    A       **Chris Golnick?**

7    Q       Yeah.

8    A       **Absolutely not.**

9                            CAPTAIN BEDELLS: I don't have any further  
10           questions.

11                           HEARING EXAMINER: I have just a couple.

12   EXAMINATION

13   BY HEARING EXAMINER:

14   Q       Chief, there's been testimony here in the last day and a  
15           half that Colonel Golnick occupied a lot of Renee's time  
16           during the duty day. Did she ever talk with you about  
17           that?

18   A       **Yes.**

19   Q       Can you talk about that?

20   A       **Yes.**

21   Q       What--

22   A       **Some of the--there were a couple of times when she would**  
23           **come home from work and, you know, once in a while things**  
24           **would be said about Chris spending a lot of time in her**  
25           **office. And she flat out told me at least on two occasions**

1           that she asked him to not spend so much time in her  
2           office, that, you know, she had work to do. And  
3           she--people--there were some people that were saying some  
4           things. And she just asked him to spend less time back  
5           there.

6    Q       So she was--would you say she was bothered by it to some  
7           degree?

8    A       I don't think she was necessarily bothered by it. I mean,  
9           you get to a point sometimes that when you have work to do  
10          and you're being distracted from your work, that's more of  
11          a distraction, maybe not a bother. I think it was more of  
12          she didn't want anybody thinking something that wasn't  
13          there, kind of thing.

14                        HEARING EXAMINER:   Okay. Thank you. Do you  
15                        guys want to follow up, either--

16                        MR. BANCHS:    No.

17                        CAPTAIN BEDELLS:   No.

18                        HEARING EXAMINER:   Mr. Banchs?

19                        MR. BANCHS:    No, sir. Thank you.

20                        HEARING EXAMINER:   All right. Chief, I'll  
21                        remind you that you remain under oath and that you are  
22                        subject to recall to this hearing until such time that it  
23                        has been adjourned. And I'll ask you not to discuss your  
24                        testimony with anyone.

25                        THE WITNESS:    Yes, sir.

1 HEARING EXAMINER: And what that, I thank you  
2 for your time and you're free to go.

3 THE WITNESS: Thank you.

4 HEARING EXAMINER: We can go off the record.

5 COURT REPORTER: It is 10:00 a.m., and we are  
6 going off the record.

7 (At 10:00 a.m., witness excused)

8 (Off the record)

9 COURT REPORTER: We are on the record. The  
10 time is now 10:33 a.m.

11 HEARING EXAMINER: Colonel McNamara, do you  
12 swear or affirm that the testimony you're about to give in  
13 this case is the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but  
14 the truth so help you God?

15 COLONEL MCNAMARA: I do.

16 HEARING EXAMINER: Further, you are advised  
17 that you are assured the freedom from restraint,  
18 interference, discrimination, coercion, or reprisal for  
19 testifying in this case.

20 COLONEL MCNAMARA: Yes, sir.

21 HEARING EXAMINER: And with that, you may have  
22 a seat. And since you are a witness for the Agency, I'll  
23 ask Captain Bedells to begin.

24 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Thank you, sir.

25 COLONEL MICHAEL McNAMARA

1 (At 10:33 a.m., sworn as a witness, testified as follows)

2 DIRECT EXAMINATION

3 BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

4 Q Sir, would you please state your full name for the record?

5 A **Michael Patrick McNamara.**

6 Q And, sir, I understand that you worked at the MATES  
7 facility. Correct?

8 A **Yes.**

9 Q And can you say when you began working at the MATES  
10 facility?

11 A **January 25th, 1995.**

12 Q And do you recall what your position was way back in--was  
13 it 1995?

14 A **Yes.**

15 Q Okay. Do you recall your position?

16 A **I was a maintenance intern.**

17 Q And at some point you were the--was your title deputy  
18 superintendent?

19 A **No.**

20 Q What was the last title you held at MATES?

21 A **Surface maintenance supervisor WS14/foreman. It was an  
22 informal title.**

23 Q Surface--surface maintenance supervisor; correct?

24 A **Uh-huh.**

25 Q Slash, foreman, okay. While you worked at MATES, did you

1           have occasion to run across Master Sergeant Reed?

2   **A     Yes, of course.**

3   Q     And do you know when Master Sergeant Reed first began

4           working at MATES approximately?

5   **A     2004-ish.**

6   Q     So the two of you worked there for a considerable period

7           of time together; correct?

8   **A     Yes.**

9   Q     And did you have occasion to work with--alongside

10          Lieutenant Colonel Golnick?

11   **A     Yes.**

12   Q     And what do you recall his position to be?

13   **A     At the end he was the superintendent. And he'd been the**

14          **superintendent a number of years.**

15   Q     Okay. When do you--when do you believe he was first named

16          superintendent, again approximately?

17   **A     Maybe 2006. And I might be off on those numbers.**

18   Q     I won't hold you to it. It's an approximation. I

19          understand. And before we start--I didn't ask you what was

20          the--

21   **A     That can't be right. It's got to be like 2003.**

22   Q     Okay. And I understand Master Sergeant Reed held a

23          position of production controller for quite a period of

24          time. Correct?

25   **A     2006, I think she was promoted, that time frame, to a GS9.**



1           **She was a senior production controller, yes.**

2    Q        Around--and at some point you were her supervisor;  
3            correct?

4    A        **For a few months before I resigned.**

5    Q        Okay. Nothing prior to that?

6    A        **No.**

7    Q        Correct? Okay. And prior to you--and I understand it was  
8            just a short period of time. Do you know who Master  
9            Sergeant Reed's supervisor was?

10   A       **Prior to what?**

11   Q        Prior to when--prior to you being her supervisor. And I  
12            understand it was a short period of time. Do you recall  
13            who her supervisor was?

14   A        **Master Sergeant Troy Herblet.**

15   Q        Okay. During the course of--or during the period of time  
16            in which you worked with Master Sergeant Reed, did you  
17            happen to interact with her in her capacity as a  
18            production controller?

19   A        **I'm sorry. I missed the first part of the question.**

20   Q        Well, while you--while you were working at MATES  
21            from--well, you worked there since 1995. But--and Master  
22            Sergeant Reed just apparently started around--as a  
23            production controller in approximately 2003, did you have  
24            occasion to work together?

25   A        **Yes.**

1 Q And in what capacity would you work together?

2 A **She was a tool and part attendant and a production**  
3 **controller. As a supervisor, every supervisor, every wage**  
4 **leader, the majority of the mechanics worked with Master**  
5 **Sergeant Reed.**

6 Q Okay. Did you have occasion to go into her office?

7 A **Absolutely.**

8 Q And would that be on a daily basis or not--

9 A **Yes.**

10 Q --that frequent? Okay. Would you have occasion to go in  
11 there more than once a day?

12 A **Sure.**

13 Q Did you have occasion to find Lieutenant Colonel Golnick  
14 in her office when you went to--when you went to see her?

15 A **Sometimes, yes.**

16 Q Was it more often than not or less often than not you'd  
17 find Lieutenant Colonel Golnick in there?

18 A **I never really kept track.**

19 Q Okay. Did it bother you to see--did it strike you as odd  
20 that the shop superintendent was in the office of a  
21 production controller?

22 A **In our facility, no.**

23 Q And why not?

24 A **Kind of a centralized management style we had. And**  
25 **Lieutenant Colonel Chris Golnick liked to keep his finger**

1           **on the pulse of job order status, work order status, parts**  
2           **status.**

3    Q       Okay. Well, I'm asking you, sir, because there's been  
4           testimony that's occurred over the last two days to the  
5           effect that Lieutenant Colonel Golnick spent an inordinate  
6           amount of time in Master Sergeant Reed's office. So my  
7           question to you is you didn't--you didn't personally  
8           observe this? Or you didn't personally feel that he had  
9           spent an inordinate amount of time? Is that your  
10          testimony?

11   A       **Well, if the boss wants to spend more time in certain**  
12           **areas, that's his call, I guess.**

13   Q       But again it didn't strike you as odd?

14   A       **I wouldn't say odd.**

15   Q       Okay. Well, what would you say?

16   A       **I'm not sure how to answer that.**

17   Q       Well, did you provide a statement in connection with the  
18          15-6?

19   A       **Yes.**

20   Q       I mean, you're aware we're here because of--and Colonel  
21          Dawkins has allowed us to dispense with the foundation and  
22          whatnot. So forgive me, and I know you have your counsel  
23          here. We don't have to establish a foundation. So you're  
24          aware there was a 15-6 that brings us here today because  
25          Master Sergeant Reed--

1    **A**    **Yes.**

2    **Q**    --was terminated; correct?

3    **A**    **Yes.**

4    **Q**    And you provided a statement; is that correct?

5    **A**    **No, I did not provide a statement.**

6    **Q**    You did not provide a sworn statement--

7    **A**    **No.**

8    **Q**    --or an unsworn statement?

9    **A**    **No.**

10   **Q**    Okay. Were you interviewed?

11   **A**    **Yes.**

12   **Q**    Okay. By whom?

13   **A**    **Lieutenant--or Colonel Doolittle.**

14   **Q**    Do you recall the subject matter of that--of that

15           interview at all?

16   **A**    **The majority of it, yes.**

17   **Q**    Do you at all recall characterizing--and you said--you

18           already said you wouldn't characterize it as odd. But do

19           you recall characterizing it in your interview with

20           Colonel Doolittle as an inappropriate relationship that

21           had happened for about four years but became worse over

22           the last couple years?

23   **A**    **Can I refer to my notes?**

24   **Q**    Absolutely; yeah, absolutely.

25   **A**    **Because I don't recall. It's been--it's been over a year**

1           **since--**

2       Q       Understood. So take your time and review the--and I think  
3               we've already established that that is not a verbatim  
4               transcript. It is just a partial transcript of sorts.

5                       MR. HETCHLER: Yeah, so this transcript hasn't  
6               been certified or--

7                       CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Negative.

8                       MR. HETCHLER: Okay. And do you have a  
9               reference for where that quote is?

10                      CAPTAIN BEDELLS: I really don't.

11                      HEARING EXAMINER: It's--there are actually  
12              two tabs. Do you see that?

13                      SERGEANT SCHULTZ: I've got B-1, sir.

14                      HEARING EXAMINER: There's an initial  
15              interview dated 16 September.

16                      MR. BANCHS: Well, that's just the notes of  
17              the--of the investigating officer, sir. It's--

18                      HEARING EXAMINER: Oh, okay.

19                      MR. BANCHS: --Colonel McNamara's demeanor  
20              during the--

21                      HEARING EXAMINER: Okay.

22                      MR. BANCHS: --during his questioning so it's  
23              not really testimony. The question was about the  
24              inappropriate relationship. The first question regarding  
25              that subject is labeled 30 in his--in the notes, because

1 it's not a transcript.

2 MR. HETCHLER: Right; notes. Do you want to  
3 look at that?

4 THE WITNESS: Sure. Could I have a reference  
5 on--

6 MR. BANCHS: Sir, the question is regarding  
7 the inappropriate relationship that you were asked--start  
8 here with question number 30.

9 THE WITNESS: Okay.

10 MR. HETCHLER: Number 30, there we go.

11 THE WITNESS: Do you mind if I read this?

12 BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

13 Q I don't mind--sir, I don't mind if you read the whole  
14 statement if that's what you want to do. We've been here  
15 for a couple solid days. A little bit longer is not going  
16 to hurt.

17 **A Okay. I remember that conversation.**

18 Q So having refreshed your recollection of your interview,  
19 how would you choose to characterize the relationship  
20 between Master Sergeant Reed and Lieutenant Colonel  
21 Golnick?

22 **A Today I'd say it's more like a familiar, family,  
23 brother-sister, father-daughter--big age difference  
24 between the two of them. There may be some thoughts out  
25 there, but I don't feel that there is any inappropriate**

1           **relationship today, no.**

2    Q       Okay. Did you hear others speak to it being inappropriate?

3    A       **There was a few, yes.**

4    Q       Did you actually--at any point did you actually talk to  
5           Lieutenant Colonel--is it Michael--it says Maddie here,  
6           but it's Maddin. Correct?

7    A       **I did not.**

8    Q       Who was--who was Lieutenant Colonel Michael Maddin?

9    A       **He was the--he was the--Scott Meyers' predecessor. He was  
10           the Surface Maintenance Manager for the state for--I don't  
11           know--year and a half, two years.**

12   Q       Okay. Did anyone, sir, approach you about their feelings  
13           about the relationship between Lieutenant Colonel Golnick  
14           and Master Sergeant Reed?

15   A       **A few did. Most of them just the typical complainers.**

16   Q       Do you recall who approached you?

17   A       **Todd Whitcher, Thad Cooper, Joel Mack.**

18   Q       And all three of those are the typical complainers?

19   A       **They complain--you know, on the one hand, there's some  
20           really good guys. On the other hand, they seem to stir the  
21           pot sometimes.**

22   Q       Okay. Anyone else approach you that you recall?

23   A       **It's Grayling, and there's rumors. And rumors--if you  
24           acknowledge the rumors, they seem to build. Small town  
25           world. If you ignore them, a lot of times, just like your**

1           **teeth, they'll go away.**

2    Q       And you didn't ever approach Lieutenant Colonel Golnick  
3           about the--about these rumors or what the complainers had  
4           told you?

5    A       **I can't say that I did or didn't. In hindsight, if I would  
6           have, I'd have probably had a tough go of it after that.  
7           So I don't think I did.**

8    Q       What do you mean if you had, you might have had a tough go  
9           of it?

10   A       **Well, if I--I'm trying to think how to say that. I think  
11           if you ever went to somebody and accused them of  
12           something, especially if they're innocent, they'd get  
13           really defensive.**

14   Q       Okay. And he was your supervisor; right?

15   A       **Yes.**

16   Q       How about Master Sergeant Reed? Did you ever think to  
17           approach Master Sergeant Reed about--about the rumors or  
18           the--

19   A       **Oh, yes.**

20   Q       --complainers?

21   A       **Yes. And we talked about it.**

22   Q       Oh, you did? Okay. Can you tell the Hearing Examiner today  
23           what you told Master Sergeant Reed if you recall?

24   A       **She--I think the gist of it was Renee and I had a  
25           conversation. And she was kind of frustrated about it. But**



1           at the same time, I don't think it was a threatening feel  
2           but at the same time I know it took away from her  
3           productivity. And I think she would agree that sometimes  
4           some of that time spent was taking her away from her work.

5    Q       And when you--when you say--for clarification, when you  
6           say some of that time, do you mean the time spent--the  
7           time spent between Master Sergeant Reed and Lieutenant  
8           Colonel Golnick in her office? Is that what we're talking  
9           about?

10   A       **Yes.**

11   Q       I only say that, sir, because I wasn't clear from your  
12           earlier testimony that we had established that you thought  
13           that there was any problem with Golnick--Lieutenant  
14           Colonel Golnick being in her office. So is it the case  
15           that you do now think that--

16   A       **No. I just think that--I think that anybody, you know,  
17           with rumors--you need to let someone know that someone's  
18           talking about you. And if you don't do that, the thing  
19           could blow up.**

20   Q       Okay. To your knowledge, did Master Sergeant Reed have a  
21           nickname around the--around the office there? And I  
22           understand--I understand you might not have called her  
23           this particular nickname. But are you aware of anyone else  
24           referring to her by a nickname other than Master Sergeant  
25           Reed?

1   **A**    **I think Princess or Precious, one of the two. I'm not**  
2           **sure.**

3    **Q**    You certainly didn't call her that?

4    **A**    **No. She'd have let me have it.**

5    **Q**    Why did--and she's pretty fit. We've established that on  
6           the record too.

7    **A**    **I don't know if you have or haven't, but she is in pretty**  
8           **good shape.**

9    **Q**    That's right. We have established it on the record. Why do  
10           you think people were referring to her as Princess or  
11           Precious? And I'll tell you what some have testified to.  
12           There are a number of witnesses who have testified that  
13           Master Sergeant Reed received preferential treatment from  
14           Lieutenant Colonel Golnick in a variety of respects. I  
15           mean, is that the reason maybe they called her Princess or  
16           Precious?

17   **A**    **You know, sometimes though a person can get promoted**  
18           **pretty quick. I think when Renee hired in, she was a Staff**  
19           **Sergeant and then made Master Sergeant, not because**  
20           **of--you know, just because she was good at her job and**  
21           **good timing with the EPS list. I think some people that**  
22           **worked hard and took a long time to make Master Sergeant**  
23           **were jealous of that. Some folks didn't make it. And, you**  
24           **know, there's some jealousy things going on too, I'm sure.**

25   **Q**    I'm sorry. Did I already ask you your thoughts about what

1 sort of production controller she was? Did I ask you that?

2 **A Say that again.**

3 Q Did I already ask you your thoughts on what sort of  
4 production controller you thought Master Sergeant Reed  
5 was?

6 **A No, you haven't.**

7 Q Okay. Well, I'll tell you again, everyone has said she's  
8 anywhere from the best production controller in the state  
9 to maybe even the country. What are your thoughts  
10 about--what are your thoughts about her capacity as a  
11 production controller?

12 **A She was absolutely a very, very, very good, great**  
13 **production controller. Renee always volunteered to go to**  
14 **PEC to learn more. She would have been a good candidate to**  
15 **sit on some of our steering committees that--I served on**  
16 **several of them for the National Guard Bureau that would**  
17 **steer policies and procedures into a certain way based on**  
18 **the new SKIP updates or whatever. I think she was a great**  
19 **employee and a great production controller.**

20 Q Well, you're--you seem to be in agreement with just  
21 about--well, every witness we've heard from. So again,  
22 just--I appreciate you coming out here, sir. You hesitate  
23 to characterize the relationship as I think odd and having  
24 reviewed your previous testimony in this matter--and I  
25 understand it's not a verbatim transcript. You're even

1           hesitant now to characterize it as inappropriate; is that  
2           correct?

3   **A     Yes.**

4   Q     Okay. So you might--you've changed your mind? Is that fair  
5           to say?

6   **A     That's fair to say. And I also believe that certain things**  
7           **were asked in a certain manner which I wasn't smart enough**  
8           **to see coming by a police officer and an officer who I**  
9           **didn't think would twist things around.**

10 Q     Okay. So all in all you didn't--you take some issue with  
11          the way the investigation occurred--is that fair to  
12          say--in to Master Sergeant Reed?

13 **A     I don't know even what she's been accused of to be honest.**  
14          **So--but--but--**

15 Q     Well, let me--let me enlighten you if you will.

16          Essentially Master Sergeant Reed was terminated by the  
17          Chief of Staff for improper use of NTVs or GSAs. Okay? In  
18          other words using an NTV or a GSA to attend drill, annual  
19          training, or while she was in her technician status for  
20          unofficial duties. That's was one ground. The other ground  
21          upon which she was terminated was for inappropriate  
22          relationship with Lieutenant Colonel Golnick that  
23          adversely affected the working environment around MATES.  
24          And you've already provided some testimony to that effect,  
25          sir, that the time she spent in her office with Lieutenant

1 Colonel Golnick took away from her productivity. I believe  
2 that was your testimony. It's in the record. So while I  
3 understand you might be unaware, having knowledge of that  
4 now, is there anything else you can tell the Hearing  
5 Examiner that might lend support or might--might give the  
6 Hearing Examiner any information that can help him decide  
7 one way or the other whether in fact Master Sergeant Reed  
8 did the things that she's alleged to have done?

9 MR. HETCHLER: Just to correct the record, if  
10 you'll allow me a little latitude, I think what the  
11 conversation you had a few moments ago was he approached  
12 her about the rumors of Golnick being in her office taking  
13 away from her production. Because he also said that she  
14 was a great employee and one of the best production  
15 controllers in the country.

16 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Okay. Then I misunderstood  
17 his earlier testimony, because I thought what he--I  
18 thought what he testified to was that he actually  
19 approached her and said--or, I'm sorry. Strike that. I  
20 misunderstood. I thought he had testified that he believed  
21 that her productivity suffered because she spent so much  
22 time in the office with Lieutenant Colonel Golnick.

23 MR. HETCHLER: I believe that was couched in  
24 the rumors of--

25 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Okay. Thanks for clarifying

1           that.

2                           THE WITNESS:   Correct.

3   BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

4   Q       So having--now knowing the reasons why Master Sergeant  
5       Reed was terminated, is there anything you can share with  
6       us that would--that would help the Hearing Examiner  
7       determine whether or not Master Sergeant Reed did these  
8       offenses of which she was accused?

9   A       **No.**

10                          CAPTAIN BEDELLS:   Okay. Thanks. I don't have  
11       any further questions. Thanks.

12                          HEARING EXAMINER:   Mr. Banchs?

13    CROSS-EXAMINATION

14   BY MR. BANCHS:

15   Q       Colonel, I'm going to ask you some questions about--well,  
16       Captain Bedells pretty much ended his questioning right  
17       now, by letting you know what the charges were that Ms.  
18       Reed was terminated for. And, again, just to refresh your  
19       memory, she was terminated for allegedly having an  
20       inappropriate relationship with Colonel Golnick and for  
21       allegedly misusing government vehicles. And you've already  
22       touched on some of the inappropriate relationship, you  
23       know, hallway chitchat, but I want to touch on the  
24       inappropriate use of government--on the alleged  
25       inappropriate use of government vehicles. And if I could

1 refer you--it's going to be question 40 in his  
2 previous--in the notes from his verbal interview.

3 MR. HETCHLER: I don't think it's here.

4 MR. BANCHS: No. It's in the big--in the big  
5 binder.

6 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: I'm going to hand it to you.

7 BY MR. BANCHS:

8 Q Sir, if you want to, take a second and read through the  
9 notes of Colonel Doolittle's interview. And that's it,  
10 sir.

11 A **Okay. I'm ready.**

12 Q Okay. So basically insofar as MATES personnel using,  
13 whether it was a GSA or an NTV to attend either an IDT or  
14 AT or even--you know, I think in the notes here of your  
15 interview it says that, you know, he lets the folks that  
16 work at the SMOs office drive NTVs to drill.

17 A **Yes.**

18 Q Was that--was MATES personnel using NTVs or GSAs to attend  
19 these types of functions? Or was that something that was  
20 out of the ordinary?

21 A **No. As long as--if I can add--**

22 Q Yes, sir.

23 A **As long as they could tie it to a legitimate reason--for**  
24 **example, if employee X, who was in a unit--and let's just**  
25 **say Jackson or Lansing--had to cross level parts to a**

1           different OMS, to a different armory, to drop off  
2           computers at the USPFO, to do a turn-in at the USPFO--and  
3           I'm not talking a folder. I'm talking something  
4           substantial. The informal rule was he would allow that to  
5           happen, he being Lieutenant Colonel Golnick would allow  
6           that to happen. Did I answer your question?

7    Q       Yes, sir. And so the follow-up question to that would be  
8           do you ever recall--do you have any firsthand knowledge of  
9           Sergeant Reed using an NTV to go to a drill or an AT?

10   A       **Are you asking me did I specifically see Master Sergeant  
11           Reed, Renee Reed--**

12   Q       Yes, sir.

13   A       **--drive out the gate on a Saturday morning to drill in a  
14           GSA?**

15   Q       Yes, sir.

16   A       **No, I have not.**

17   Q       Okay. Now, did you hear any rumors or allegations that she  
18           was using an NTV or a GSA on a regular basis to either go  
19           to drill or AT?

20   A       **I heard those rumors, yes.**

21   Q       Did you find any credibility in those rumors that she was  
22           misusing it?

23   A       **No, I did not.**

24   Q       I think we've exhausted the inappropriate relationship  
25           questions anyway. I don't think I can ask you anything



1 else that Captain Bedells did, so I'll just ask you  
2 directly. Sir, do you believe that Sergeant Reed should  
3 have been fired?

4 **A No.**

5 **Q** And if you could, expand on that answer. Why?

6 **A I don't think she did anything wrong, and I don't think**  
7 **there's any proof that she did anything wrong.**

8 **Q** Okay. Fair enough.

9 **A And I'm trying to think if I should end it with anything**  
10 **else. I'll end with that.**

11 **Q** And understanding that--understanding that you were--you  
12 were at the MATES for a long time, so this--your opinion  
13 of this is--you know, let me back up, you know, because we  
14 never did establish this. How long have you been knowing  
15 Sergeant Reed?

16 **A 2014--professionally 12 years and I met her a couple years**  
17 **prior to that.**

18 **Q** Okay. So you've had personal and professional interactions  
19 with her?

20 **A Yes.**

21 **Q** And in those interactions, do you find her to be--what do  
22 you--what is your opinion of her--of her as a person and  
23 her character both as a coworker and as an individual?

24 **A I believe she upholds the Army values for sure, and that's**  
25 **not just a coined phrase. I mean, she's an honest person.**

1           **She's hardworking. She takes her job serious, and she**  
2           **doesn't--she doesn't rest on her heels.**

3    Q       Roger that. And, sir, to follow--I'm sorry, because I kind  
4           of went out of order. But the follow-up question--you've  
5           already said that you thought that she should not have  
6           been fired. So if she were to be reinstated, would you  
7           necessarily have any issue with that?

8    A       **No. I'd have issue if she wasn't.**

9                           MR. BANCHS: Thank you, sir.

10                          HEARING EXAMINER: Any redirect, Captain  
11           Bedells?

12   REDIRECT EXAMINATION

13   BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

14   Q       I have a couple questions and I don't want to belabor the  
15           point, Lieutenant Colonel McNamara, but I'm going to give  
16           your attorney this and ask you to read your answers again  
17           to number--to number 30. Read them to yourself.

18                          MR. HETCHLER: Wait a minute. I'll give it to  
19           you in a second.

20                          THE WITNESS: Okay.

21   BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

22   Q       I need that book back. I'm going to ask you--you have your  
23           memory refreshed?

24   A       **Not very good.**

25                          MR. BANCHS: I can--I can give him this copy.

1 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Let him take a look at that.

2 This is the official Exhibit, so I--

3 MR. HETCHLER: I shouldn't have written in it  
4 for you then.

5 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: That's all right.

6 MR. BANCHS: Here you go, sir.

7 THE WITNESS: Thank you.

8 MR. BANCHS: You're welcome.

9 BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

10 Q So you were asked--and I understand you've already  
11 established you took issue with the manner in which  
12 Colonel Doolittle conducted this investigation. But you  
13 were asked, "Are you aware of any real or perceived  
14 inappropriate relationships at MATES"; correct? Number 30,  
15 that was the question; correct?

16 A Yes.

17 Q Okay, great. And did you--this answer that follows, did  
18 you type this yourself? Or did--was this transcribed?

19 A I didn't type anything.

20 Q So this was--this was the transcribed interview. Okay? Do  
21 you take issue with anything here? Is it inaccurate in any  
22 respect, in other words?

23 A No.

24 Q So I want to draw your attention, sir, to the last--the  
25 last few sentences. If you look up from--the third line

1 up, it says "There's a perception that something is going  
2 on." Do you see that sentence?

3 **A Uh-huh.**

4 **Q** Okay. And understanding you don't take issue with what was  
5 apparently transcribed, you said, "There's a perception  
6 that something is going on. Do I know anything's going on?  
7 No. Does it sure seem like it is? Yes." And then you went  
8 on to say, "Then I thought maybe she grew up without a dad  
9 and maybe it's just a father figure thing and then that's  
10 what"--"and then what are the dirty jokes about?" So  
11 you--do you have a recollection of saying that or not?

12 **A Not really. It's been over a year. I tried to wash this  
13 whole thing from my mind.**

14 **Q** Understandable. But do you take issue with the fact that  
15 you apparently testified that it sure seemed like there  
16 was something going on, although you didn't have any  
17 evidence?

18 **A I think what I said here is, do I know that anything is  
19 going on? No.**

20 **Q** Right. And then you went on to say, "Does it sure seem  
21 like it is? Yes."

22 **A And then I went on to say--you know, and again in  
23 hindsight when I think about the relationship after I've  
24 had time to reflect on it for a year--and believe me  
25 there's been a lot of reflection. I don't think there's**

1           **anything to it other than just like I said, a familiar**  
2           **relationship.**

3    Q       Okay. But at the time, it apparently seemed to be like  
4           there was something going on?

5    A       **At the time, the way questions were asked and the way the**  
6           **interrogation went, the interrogation wasn't pleasant. And**  
7           **I never dreamed that would ever happen.**

8    Q       And if you could turn the page--or wait. I don't know if  
9           you--I don't know if you have to turn your page, because  
10          it doesn't match up. There's another question I want you  
11          to go to the question that says "And how does that make  
12          you feel?" Do you see that question?

13   A       **Uh-huh.**

14   Q       Take a--take a moment to read that, your response, please.

15   A       **Okay.**

16   Q       You read the--

17   A       **Uh-huh.**

18   Q       You read the response? You write--

19   A       **I didn't write anything.**

20   Q       I'm sorry. We've been dealing with sworn statements. So  
21          it's recorded that you said it's gross, it's a 35 year-old  
22          girl with a--oh, by the way, it's Master Sergeant Reed's  
23          birthday today too.

24                                "It's a 35-year-old girl with a

25                                57--58-year-old guy. I guess that's okay if it's at

1           the bar, but when it's at the workplace, it wouldn't  
2           matter at the workplace if they were the same age.  
3           Honestly, Renee in theory works for me, but she  
4           doesn't. She works directly for Chris. And I'm  
5           telling you, if anybody walks into that shop and,  
6           hey, where's Chris? Have you checked Renee's office?  
7           And there they are."

8           Do you recall making a statement to that effect?

9   **A     If it's transcribed, I must have.**

10  **Q**     Okay. Well, what I'm trying to get at--and I understand  
11           your--your view of the relationship has changed over the  
12           last year. I understand that. But has this changed in any  
13           respect? Or was it in fact the case that if you were  
14           looking for Chris, you found him in Renee's office?

15  **A**     **He could be found there quite a bit, yeah. But, you know,**  
16           **he could be found in Joe Smock's office too or Dean**  
17           **Miller's.**

18  **Q**     Okay. And we've had some testimony to this effect, sir,  
19           that--you then go on to say--and read along--

20                         "They work out together and if you walk in  
21                         while they're working out, they start whispering or  
22                         quit talking. If you walk in, it's like you are  
23                         interrupting them. Purposefully, I'll walk in there  
24                         just to piss him off."

25  **A**     **I did say that.**

1 Q And I understand that--

2 A **Whether Renee is there or not, that had nothing to do with**  
3 **it. We always get customers at the end of the day. We**  
4 **always would get customers.**

5 Q So this didn't have to do with he and Renee being in the  
6 gym--

7 A **Uh-huh.**

8 Q --this was just him in the gym?

9 A **Uh-huh.**

10 Q Okay. I misunderstood that--that question then. What's the  
11 bra thing?

12 A **That was a rumor that bras or underwear were tied on doors**  
13 **and antennas. I don't even know who did it.**

14 Q But the--there's no allegation that it was Master Sergeant  
15 Reed's bra?

16 A **Unh-unh.**

17 Q Okay. So that's immaterial. So if you--sitting here today,  
18 if you had to characterize the relationship between Master  
19 Sergeant Reed and Lieutenant Colonel Golnick, what I'm  
20 getting from you is that you might characterize it as a  
21 familial relationship? Is that right?

22 A **Uh-huh.**

23 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: I don't have any further  
24 questions, sir.

25 HEARING EXAMINER: Mr. Banchs, do you want to

1 Recross?

2 MR. BANCHS: Yes, sir.

3 RE-CROSS-EXAMINATION

4 BY MR. BANCHS:

5 Q I just want to touch on something. And if I'm reading the  
6 notes from the investigating officer, I guess, correctly,  
7 you make a statement here that Thad Cooper will tell  
8 you--and Thad Cooper and Mr. Whitcher have testified that  
9 they worked in the same office with you.

10 A Yes.

11 Q And you repeatedly say that it--that it was perception and  
12 that you didn't know for sure whether it was an  
13 inappropriate relationship or not?

14 A Correct.

15 Q So was your perception derived from these two individuals  
16 talking as well?

17 A Yes.

18 Q Okay. So it was more of the hallway chitchat that we've  
19 been hearing throughout this hearing?

20 A Oh, absolutely. When you sit in a dark house and think  
21 about things all day long, you have time probably to  
22 better reflect and what really happened, compared to what  
23 was drug out of you during an interrogation.

24 MR. BANCHS: Roger that, sir. I just--okay. I  
25 don't have any further questions right now.



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

REDIRECT EXAMINATION

BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

Q I just have one follow-up, again, to the inappropriateness. You said that it was a familial relationship. I'm presuming that means it wasn't sexual. Right? I mean, you didn't view this relationship between two of them as sexual in any way; correct?

**A No.**

Q Well, would it have to be sexual to be deemed inappropriate?

**A What would you consider inappropriate?**

Q Well, I don't know. I'm asking you the question.

**A Well, I don't--**

Q I can't put in evidence here. I'm not--so you answer the questions. Would a relationship have to be sexual in order to be deemed inappropriate?

**A No.**

Q So what else might make a relationship inappropriate in the workplace?

**A Threats of physical violence, coercion, but nothing that applies here.**

Q Okay. Well, what about--let me propose this. What about like a loose familiarity, I mean, in the workplace? What if I came up and called you "Mike"?

**A It happens every day.**

1 Q In the workplace?

2 A **It happens every day. No problem. I encourage it.**

3 Q Okay. Would everyone encourage it? Or would--or were there  
4 other people--did you call Chris "Chris"? Or did you call  
5 him Lieutenant Colonel Golnick, or how did you refer to  
6 him?

7 A **Depends if--**

8 Q Well, I saw one way you referred to him in the book.

9 A **Uh-huh.**

10 Q Don't refer to him that way.

11 A **It depends on the day.**

12 Q But would you agree, sir, that--that the setting in which  
13 we work some people might view familiarity as  
14 inappropriate? I might object to Staff Sergeant Schultz  
15 calling me Dave. Would you agree with that?

16 A **No, I wouldn't agree with that a bit, not a bit.**

17 Q So you think that's completely appropriate?

18 A **Absolutely it is.**

19 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Okay. I don't have any  
20 further questions, sir.

21 CROSS-EXAMINATION

22 BY MR. BANCHS:

23 Q So it's more like the Air Guard at the MATES than it is  
24 the Army?

25 A **I don't have much experience with the--but I'll tell you,**

1 I signed every one of my emails until I became the deputy  
2 post commander--and I only did that because when I sent  
3 those emails they need to be more professional.

4 Q Roger that.

5 A But I signed every one of my emails "Mike."

6 Q Well, sir, you know, since Captain Bedells--

7 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Is there--

8 BY MR. BANCHS:

9 Q I just want to--I just want to establish this because  
10 basically the atmosphere at the MATES was informal, for  
11 the lack of a better word. Would you just say that  
12 is--that is accurate?

13 A Absolutely, yes.

14 Q Okay. And I asked a previous witness about this because I  
15 had firsthand knowledge of this. But I remember when I  
16 visited this facility two years ago and I met you in your  
17 office. There was a leave excuse wheel that you guys used  
18 to have. Right?

19 A Yeah, yeah.

20 Q And everybody used it; correct?

21 A Only for the leave abusers, yes.

22 Q Right. And it wasn't--it wasn't like a real leave wheel  
23 where people would go there and spin the wheel and that  
24 was the reason they were using to leave, but it was more  
25 of a joke that you had going for the folks that--can you

1 explain the leave wheel?

2 **A I won't say that I had going but I sure participated in**  
3 **it.**

4 **Q** Right. But that was the atmosphere of the MATES? Would  
5 that be correct?

6 **A Yes.**

7 **Q** And it was--it was prevalent throughout the entire  
8 facility, not just restricted to Colonel Golnick and  
9 Sergeant Reed?

10 **A Correct.**

11 **Q** Okay. Thank you very much, sir.

12 **A That was a small town.**

13 MR. BANCHS: Roger. Okay.

14 REDIRECT EXAMINATION

15 BY CAPTAIN BEDELLS:

16 **Q** Lieutenant Colonel McNamara, would you--would you invite  
17 the possibility that it's this informality or informality  
18 that maybe some people took issue with? And by some  
19 people, I mean those people you characterize as talking  
20 about rumors or complainers I think you referred to them.  
21 I mean, is it possible that some people objected to this  
22 informality?

23 **A No.**

24 **Q** No, not a possibility?

25 **A If it is, it's only on a given day.**

1 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Okay.

2 EXAMINATION

3 BY HEARING EXAMINER:

4 Q I have one question.

5 A Yes, sir.

6 Q In your opinion, did Colonel Golnick demonstrate  
7 favoritism towards Master Sergeant Reed?

8 A I think the best way to answer that, sir, is I think that  
9 good employees got a little bit more latitude than  
10 employees that spun the wheel. Or that if somebody was  
11 proactive and planned, I think--I think anybody, any  
12 manager, would allow more latitude for somebody that had  
13 their stuff in a group compared to people that were  
14 willy-nilly or helter-skelter or that were rabble-rousers.  
15 So to answer your question, no more than any other good  
16 employee.

17 Q Okay. Thank you.

18 A Yes, sir.

19 HEARING EXAMINER: All right. I remind you  
20 that you remain under oath and that you are subject to  
21 recall to this hearing until such time that it has been  
22 adjourned. And I also remind you not to discuss your  
23 testimony with anyone. And with that, I thank you for your  
24 time, and you're free to go.

25 THE WITNESS: Yes, sir.

1 HEARING EXAMINER: Thanks. And we'll go off  
2 the record.

3 COURT REPORTER: It is now 11:15 a.m. We are  
4 go off the record.

5 (At 11:15 a.m., witness excused)

6 (Off the record)

7 HEARING EXAMINER: Back on the record.

8 COURT REPORTER: We are on the record. The  
9 time is now 1:09 p.m.

10 HEARING EXAMINER: Okay. We are ready for  
11 closing statements, and I'll turn it over to Captain  
12 Bedells for the Agency's closing statement.

13 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: Thank you, sir. At the  
14 outset of these hearings, when we were here a couple of  
15 Mondays ago for a pre-hearing, you advised us that you  
16 were primarily or principally interested in three  
17 questions, the first being did the offense occur, the  
18 second being is some discipline appropriate, and in this  
19 particular case, was termination appropriate. So with  
20 respect to this case, we've heard from a number of  
21 witnesses, some of whom provided sworn statements, some of  
22 whom provided audio interviews, some of whom we had a  
23 transcript of sorts. We've heard the relationship  
24 described as inappropriate, strange, uncomfortable,  
25 awkward, more than professional, and one even testified

1           that he viewed it as a middle school boyfriend-girlfriend  
2           type of relationship.

3                         I think--I think--and the legal term of course  
4           is "inappropriate." That summarizes it. Some of the  
5           witnesses from whom we heard seemed to be hung up on the  
6           fact that--and there was no testimony to suggest that the  
7           relationship was sexual. But they then deemed it was not  
8           inappropriate because there was no allegation that it was  
9           sexual in nature. The last witness we heard from  
10          characterized it as familial and not inappropriate for the  
11          workplace. Well, I would suggest that a familial  
12          relationship within the confines of MATES which is--which  
13          is a facility that's irreducibly military in nature, is  
14          inappropriate. We are the Armed Services. In this case, we  
15          are--we are the Army. We adhere to military customs and  
16          courtesies. We don't refer to one another, much as Mike  
17          would have us believe, by their first name. I refer to you  
18          as "Sir," when you hand the questioning off to me. Staff  
19          Sergeant Schultz refers to me as "Sir," and so forth.  
20          That's because we are irreducibly military in nature.

21                         Now, a number of these witnesses that we've  
22          heard from over the last couple days have testified about  
23          the--for lack of a better expression, the totality of the  
24          relationship. We were not here to suggest that Master  
25          Sergeant Reed and Lieutenant Colonel Golnick having

1 breakfast on a single occasion constituted an  
2 inappropriate relationship. But that's--and after all,  
3 that's not what we heard. We heard from witness after  
4 witness that it wasn't just one breakfast. It wasn't just  
5 one lunch. It wasn't just one workout, and it wasn't that  
6 he--that Lieutenant Colonel Golnick and Master Sergeant  
7 Reed spent five hours in her office on a particular given  
8 day. Sir, it was the testimony of, as I said, a number of  
9 witnesses that they routinely ate together most every day  
10 in Master Sergeant Reed's office. They worked out most  
11 every single day together, and that Lieutenant Colonel  
12 Golnick spent anywhere from, at the high end, seven and  
13 one-half hours of an eight-hour day in Master Sergeant  
14 Reed's office to, at the low end, maybe 50 percent of the  
15 day.

16 Master Sergeant Sheldon, who I don't happen to  
17 believe, says maybe it was something less than 50 percent.  
18 In any event, all the testimony compromises a picture that  
19 this relationship is clearly not appropriate. No  
20 supervisor spends half, much less an entire day, in one of  
21 his employee's office without affecting the operation of  
22 MATES. It effect--and I'll get to the effects. So the  
23 effects are, how can Lieutenant Colonel Golnick be doing  
24 his job properly as the superintendent if he's spending  
25 even half of his day in one employee's office? And I



1 understand that Master Sergeant Reed might have  
2 complained. But it's not as if she wasn't without the  
3 power to say something. By her husband's own admission,  
4 they were close friends. Okay? And I imagine, based on  
5 what Lieutenant Colonel McNamara testified to, the  
6 conversation would have went much like this, "Hey, Chris,  
7 you're bugging me. I've got to get work done." That's not  
8 what happened.

9 We heard this persisted over a long period of  
10 time. Master Sergeant Reed elected not to say anything,  
11 and she didn't say anything because she was receiving  
12 preferential treatment. She was receiving preferential  
13 treatment in the form of her ability to use government  
14 GSAs and NTVs. She was--she was getting preferential  
15 treatment in her ability to be awarded time off awards  
16 and/or comp time. So as we look at this--and we had  
17 witnesses who suggested that, you know, in a vacuum of  
18 course eating once or twice even a week together might not  
19 constitute an inappropriate relationship. This  
20 relationship, sir, was inappropriate. Again, we don't have  
21 the MATES superintendent spending as much as time as he  
22 did in one employee's office. We heard from some of the  
23 witness--some of the witnesses who attempted through their  
24 best efforts to explain away, if you will, the use of an  
25 NTV to go on a--to go to drill on one particular occasion.

1 We weren't here to suggest that Master Sergeant Reed  
2 used--and I don't think you heard testimony from a single  
3 witness supporting the proposition that Master Sergeant  
4 Reed used an NTV or GSA to travel to drill every drill.  
5 That is simply not the case. What you did hear from  
6 several witnesses is they witnessed her using Lieutenant  
7 Colonel Golnick's own NTV, loading it up with her personal  
8 effects, and driving to drill.

9 Now, the affidavits--strike that. The sworn  
10 statements of Lieutenant Colonel Perricane, Major Ruby and  
11 some others notwithstanding, even Mr. Sheldon who  
12 testified that, "No, I've seen her drive her POV to  
13 drill." Well, we didn't--we don't maintain that she--that  
14 Master Sergeant Reed never drove her POV to drill. And we  
15 don't maintain that she drove an NTV to drill every  
16 single--every single drill. It's just she did it and  
17 others were not allowed to do it. That's the issue. The  
18 only thing--I recall Master Sergeant Sheldon's testimony.  
19 I mean, he admitted to misusing an NTV as well. That's the  
20 only honest thing I think came out of the guy's mouth,  
21 frankly. But, again, we had multiple witnesses say they  
22 saw her use NTVs for drill and possibly to go to AT. And  
23 Lieutenant Colonel Golnick's authorization, okay, doesn't  
24 make it right. What it makes is a case for preferential  
25 treatment. Because we didn't hear from these other

1 witnesses--not one of them other than Master Sergeant  
2 Sheldon, say, "Yeah, I was allowed to use an NTV to go to  
3 drill." That's because they knew it was wrong.

4 Now, with respect to the issue of discipline  
5 and whether it's appropriate, this is the second question  
6 you asked us to answer. The Agency disciplined both  
7 parties. They didn't single out Master Sergeant Reed. They  
8 did what was called for and what was responsible and  
9 expected of any organization, and that is to discipline  
10 both parties of the relationship, because both parties are  
11 culpable. Both parties could have ended it. She didn't end  
12 it. The Agency ended it when they terminated both of them.  
13 Now, the basis for discipline--I want to read, because I  
14 hadn't had a chance to read it until now, paragraph 4-14  
15 of AR 600-20. I'm going to read it into the record:

16 "The term officer as used in this paragraph  
17 includes both commissioned and warrant officers  
18 unless otherwise stated. The provisions of this  
19 paragraph apply to both relationships between Army  
20 personnel (to include dual status military  
21 technicians in the Army Reserve and the Army  
22 National Guard and between Army personnel and  
23 personnel of other military services. This policy is  
24 effective immediately except where noted below and  
25 applies to different gender relationships and same

1 gender relationships."

2 Paragraph b, "Relationships between soldiers  
3 of different rank are prohibited if they 1)  
4 compromise or appear to compromise the integrity of  
5 supervisory authorize or the chain of command, 2)  
6 cause actual or perceived partiality or unfairness,  
7 3) involve or appear to involve the improper use of  
8 rank or position for personal gain, 4) are or are  
9 perceived to be exploitive or coercive in nature, 5)  
10 create an actual or clearly predictable adverse  
11 impact on discipline, authority, morale, or the  
12 ability of the command to accomplish its mission."

13 Sir, when you read sub-paragraph b, 1 through  
14 5, we've hit all of them. Okay. Some people objected to  
15 the term "perception." It's right in the reg. You can't  
16 create the appearance. The witnesses may object to the  
17 term "perception." They might object to rumor. They might  
18 object to whatever. The fact is the reg says don't do it,  
19 don't create an appearance that would compromise the  
20 integrity of the chain of command. Don't create a  
21 perception of partiality or unfairness. Don't use rank or  
22 position for personal gain. Don't create an actual or  
23 clearly predictable adverse impact on discipline,  
24 authority, morale, or the ability of the command to  
25 accomplish its mission. We heard from several witnesses.

1           They went in to Master Sergeant Reed's office. They  
2           attempted to drop off job orders or pick up job orders or  
3           whatever the case may be, and they couldn't do it.  
4           Lieutenant Colonel Golnick was a fixture in that office,  
5           and it affected the mission at MATES. We cannot explain  
6           this reg. It applies to technicians as well, including  
7           dual status military technicians.

8                         Finally, sir, the final question that you  
9           asked us to answer is--and in this case because Master  
10          Sergeant Reed was terminated, was termination appropriate.  
11          And I will concede to you that in my estimation as I--as  
12          we wind up this case, this is probably going to be the  
13          hardest prong if you will of this--of this analysis. We've  
14          heard from multiple people--and I have no--I didn't have a  
15          single witness to dispute it. I would have stipulated to  
16          the--to it after I heard it for the third time. She is an  
17          outstanding production controller. But just as we had in  
18          the last hearing, if we had found out in the last hearing  
19          that Master Sergeant Smock was the greatest seamstress or  
20          whatever it was--whatever his job of the day was, if he  
21          were the greatest at it, we don't keep them around.  
22          Sometimes you have no choice but to terminate people. You  
23          have to. She was an outstanding production controller. I  
24          have no doubt about it. If we don't terminate people, we  
25          condone this type of conduct, the type of conduct that is

1 forbidden, in AR 600-20 4-14. And what message does that  
2 send to the other employees throughout the Agency? Master  
3 Sergeant Reed was a willful participant in this  
4 relationship, sir. She--we heard--we did not hear from a  
5 single person who might have said, "She came to me and  
6 asked me to tell Lieutenant Colonel Golnick to stop it."  
7 What we did hear, she objected to the term Princess  
8 understandably so, but she didn't end it. The Agency ended  
9 it. And it's because she didn't think it was wrong. It was  
10 because she derived benefits. The Agency didn't single her  
11 out. It didn't single Lieutenant Colonel Golnick out. Her  
12 fellow employees at the Agency, regrettably for her,  
13 singled her out. There are no winners, just like the Smock  
14 file. We heard--we heard--just as I closed in the Smock  
15 hearing, sir, this is a small community. It's terribly  
16 difficult for some of these employees to come forward, but  
17 they did what they thought was right. For those reasons, I  
18 think that, as tough as it might be to answer this prong,  
19 there's no other--there's no other choice but to terminate  
20 Master Sergeant Reed because if we don't, we accept it. I  
21 don't have anything further.

22 HEARING EXAMINER: Thank you. Mr. Banchs, do  
23 you have a closing statement?

24 MR. BANCHS: Yes, sir, I do.

25 HEARING EXAMINER: Go ahead.

1                   MR. BANCHS: Thank you, sir. Sir, I would like  
2                   to make clear up front that this case is not about  
3                   Lieutenant Colonel Golnick's actions as much as the Agency  
4                   would like to make it so. The Agency had their opportunity  
5                   to deal with Colonel Golnick. And to correct the record,  
6                   he was not terminated. He retired. And based on the  
7                   testimony of Lieutenant Colonel Meyers, Lieutenant Colonel  
8                   Golnick may still have to answer to some missing items  
9                   once they complete ongoing investigations, whether they  
10                  might be FLIPLs or 15-6s. So rather this case dealt with  
11                  two specific charges against the Appellant, Mrs. Renee  
12                  Reed, that she had an impermissible relationship with  
13                  Lieutenant Colonel Chris Golnick because they were of  
14                  different ranks. And that's what the charge stated in the  
15                  proposed Adverse Action and that she misused government  
16                  property. And while the Agency tried to make a distinction  
17                  between the two, it is clear that the charge that she  
18                  misused government property was directly tied to the  
19                  allegations that she was able to do that because of the  
20                  impermissible relationship.

21                         As we said in our technician reply, it is  
22                         extremely troubling that an individual's entire career  
23                         could be jeopardized by rumor, innuendo, and lies  
24                         promulgated by some and accepted at face value by a  
25                         investigator that failed to do his job. But this exactly

1           what we have in this case. It's also extremely difficult  
2           to fend off those same false allegations once they have  
3           been validated by a figure of authority, because it  
4           becomes a situation of hearsay and sometimes double  
5           hearsay as we heard in the Smock case. It's a  
6           he-said-she-said and then goes he said--I mean, it's  
7           just--it just goes down a rabbit hole that nobody can ever  
8           chase down. How do you prove a negative? How do you know  
9           what you don't know? So in this case the most effective  
10          way to rebut allegations of misconduct and refute  
11          allegations of wrongdoing is to seek character references  
12          about the accused because of the nature of the  
13          allegations.

14                           And you see character references from reliable  
15          sources and within and without the organization, including  
16          some of the same individuals on whose testimony Colonel  
17          Doolittle relied upon to reach his recommendations. It's  
18          telling that while Colonel Doolittle claimed that he ran  
19          out of the time to conduct his investigation and it's  
20          telling that while the Agency's own representatives,  
21          whether it was Colonel Meyers or Colonel Durkac, seemed to  
22          rush to judgment. In less than two weeks, Master Sergeant  
23          Reed was able to secure over 30 individual character  
24          references from all levels of the Michigan National Guard.  
25          And from those--some of those were related--and from those



1 who were related or associated to the Michigan National  
2 Guard. Some of those are folks who the Agency has seen fit  
3 to promote to leadership positions at the MATES post this  
4 investigation. All of those people that she got character  
5 references from are those people that know her, some who  
6 know her very well. They know her character, and they are  
7 able to vouch and confirm her integrity, her core values,  
8 and they help paint a picture, a much more different  
9 picture than the one portrayed by the investigating  
10 officer and the four or five core individuals who seemed  
11 to collectively want to smear Master Sergeant Reed's  
12 reputation and good name--and by the way, Sergeant Smock's  
13 as well.

14 We've heard testimony from a number of  
15 witnesses over the last two days. And we have also made  
16 reference to the contents of the 15-6 investigation  
17 conducted by Colonel Doolittle, and other evidence has  
18 been submitted. And since you have these sources readily  
19 available to you, I'm not going to retry the case here.  
20 But I do want to draw your attention to something that was  
21 clearly established by all who testified. Renee is without  
22 a doubt the best at what she does in the entire state and  
23 perhaps outside as well. This was confirmed by both her  
24 supporters and detractors. And that's important, because  
25 Mrs. Reed is and was an asset to this organization, and

1 that's something you have to consider. Even in light of  
2 the alleged distractions that she was faced with on a  
3 daily basis, Renee managed to do her job above and beyond  
4 the call of duty. This is also important because it calls  
5 into question the allegations or insinuations made by  
6 individuals like Janet Fouts and Sharon and Todd Witcher,  
7 Thad Cooper and Joel Mack, that she was being awarded time  
8 off awards and that she was being awarded quality step  
9 increases or QSIs and that these awards were based on  
10 favoritism rather than merit.

11           Clearly, if we're to believe that Renee is the  
12 best at what she does, then she was more than deserving of  
13 her awards. And along these lines it's also important to  
14 highlight that some of these same individuals that accused  
15 her of benefiting from this alleged impermissible  
16 relationship also enjoyed the same level of recognition,  
17 some even more so like Janet Fouts who, based on the  
18 Agency's own record in the record since 2007, she's been  
19 the top recipient of time off awards, more than anyone  
20 else at the facility. And it was even established that  
21 Fouts herself was the recipient of a QSI at some point in  
22 time. In other words, she derived no more benefit from her  
23 relationship--Mrs. Reed derived no more benefit from her  
24 relationship with Lieutenant Colonel Golnick than others  
25 did. Sharon Witcher testified that she received a QSI and

1 in fact 2012 Sharon Whitcher received four hours less than  
2 Ms. Reed did. As with the entire investigation, Renee's  
3 case was long on hearsay and short on facts. Colonel  
4 Doolittle's investigation was not completed, by his own  
5 accounts. And the Agency's subsequent action also calls  
6 into question whether Renee received fair consideration  
7 before discipline was decided upon. As we stated before  
8 during the Smock case and during our closing, while it was  
9 possible for Lieutenant Colonel Meyers to review and  
10 render six different Adverse Actions in a span of two  
11 weeks, it is implausible whether deliberately other not,  
12 that he gave those he proposed for discipline, including  
13 Renee, full consideration.

14 Also, it is my expert opinion that it is  
15 categorically impossible for Colonel Durkac to have given  
16 full consideration to the contents of the 15-6  
17 investigation, to Lieutenant Colonel Meyers' proposal, and  
18 to Mrs. Reed's reply and rebuttal evidence in a span of  
19 less than 48 hours. Colonel Durkac--as in the Reed case,  
20 Colonel Durkac never saw fit to explain his rush to  
21 judgment. And the only conclusion one can draw is that the  
22 decision was already made. The majority of us in this room  
23 have been in or around the National Guard for most of our  
24 lives. So let's just be honest. The Guard is not active  
25 duty. The Guard has been and always will be a family. Most

1 of us grow up together, we join the Guard together, we do  
2 eat breakfast, lunch and dinner together. We laugh, we  
3 joke, and we cry together, and we serve in combat  
4 together. We make lifelong friends in the Guard, and  
5 sometimes we find our significant others, sometimes once,  
6 twice, or even three times in the Guard. But the point is  
7 the Guard is a family. And it's not strange or  
8 inappropriate for an NCO to call commissioned officers by  
9 their first name, especially if they have a relationship  
10 that extends outside of the front gate, because we're not  
11 military full time. If you're a technician, we are  
12 civilians.

13 And that's what you have here. As much as some  
14 may not have liked it or tried to make something more out  
15 of than was there, you had two friends. Some would like us  
16 to believe that this was more than a friendship. Some even  
17 got up here on the stand and they testified that they were  
18 bothered by the relationship and that they even had to  
19 burn leave because they couldn't stand it anymore. And  
20 these same people want us to believe that work is for work  
21 and that anytime a non--any type of nonwork interaction at  
22 work, whether it'd be talking about football or fishing or  
23 hanging out at the bar the night before, or even telling a  
24 dirty joke or two, that this type of behavior isn't and  
25 should not be tolerated, basically that work is like being

1 at a convent or at a monastery. It's ludicrous. Certainly  
2 they had no issues with their own nonwork-related  
3 conversations and interactions with other coworkers  
4 regardless of their rank.

5 For example, Thad Cooper and Todd Witcher  
6 honestly want us to believe that they shared an office  
7 with Lieutenant Colonel McNamara for a period of several  
8 years and that they never cut up, that they never talked  
9 about marital problems or about the Lions losing or Green  
10 Bay winning or that they even--that they never shared a  
11 meal together. And I brought this up myself because I saw  
12 it myself. They even had a leave excuse wheel for their  
13 top leave users that they would spin and use--what excuse  
14 are they going to use today for leave? And everybody knew  
15 about it. And it's clear that it's a double standard,  
16 because if it's wrong for Renee and Golnick to carry on as  
17 they allegedly did, then the standard should be applied  
18 across the board whether it's male or female. But it never  
19 is.

20 Now, was Lieutenant Colonel Golnick's repeated  
21 presence in Renee's office appropriate? Maybe not all the  
22 time. But it was definitely not impermissible based on the  
23 standard that exists throughout the facility. And based on  
24 reliable witnesses, like Chief Miller, it was not limited  
25 to just Renee. Others testified that Golnick was a

1 hands-on individual, perhaps a borderline micromanager, so  
2 much so that no one, not even the second highest ranking  
3 individual at the facility, dared approach him or question  
4 him. And by this standard, how is it fair to punish Renee  
5 for Lieutenant Colonel Golnick's voluntary visits?  
6 Testimony has shown that she was--testimony has shown that  
7 she was not prone to be in his office, that he would be  
8 the one to come to her office and that she had complained  
9 or made remarks to others including her husband that she  
10 was glad that he was not at work on a certain day so that  
11 she could get her work done. So it's fair to say, if you  
12 believe the others, they were afraid of Golnick. It's fair  
13 to say that Renee did not necessarily want Golnick in her  
14 office all the time as some alluded. But how is this fair  
15 to expect her to confront him about it when everyone else  
16 said that they were, for lack of a better word, afraid of  
17 questioning the king's actions?

18 It's important to note that everyone except  
19 Ms. Reed's four primary detractors said Renee should have  
20 her job back. Even one of her primary detractors, Joel  
21 Mack, unequivocally said that she should not have been  
22 fired. But the individuals that would not say one way or  
23 the other, they couldn't even say definitively whether she  
24 should have been fired, and in fact they refused to say  
25 she should be. And this also calls into question their

1 testimony, because if they are comfortable with their  
2 testimony, and the statements that they gave the  
3 investigating officer and their testimony here in your  
4 presence, and they're comfortable with that testimony and  
5 all the allegations that they levied against her, then  
6 they should have no problem saying that, yeah, she should  
7 have been fired. But they can't say it.

8 But in my opinion the most important witness  
9 is Renee's husband himself, Jim Reed. The types of  
10 allegations made against Renee cannot be easy for a spouse  
11 to hear or read about. And Jim Reed was clear that he  
12 never before, during or after the investigation--he never  
13 had a doubt about the type of interactions between Renee  
14 and Lieutenant Colonel Golnick and that he never suspected  
15 anything other than an extension of the close friendship  
16 they all have had for nearly ten years. Sir, Mrs. Reed  
17 should be reinstated. By all accounts, the Michigan  
18 National Guard is a better place with her than it is  
19 without her. Thank you, sir.

20 HEARING EXAMINER: Thank you. Master Sergeant  
21 Reed, I'll now ask you for the record, do you feel that  
22 you've had a fair opportunity to present your side of the  
23 case?

24 MASTER SERGEANT REED: Yes, sir.

25 HEARING EXAMINER: Okay. Thank you. Before we

1 close, I just want to--I want to thank some folks. I want  
2 to thank both parties and your teams for your vigor and  
3 your cooperation and your flexibility during both of these  
4 cases. And I include you as part of that too. Thanks. It's  
5 run smoothly. It's not been pleasant, but it went well. I  
6 also want to thank HRO folks for all the behind-the-scenes  
7 work. It took us a long time to get here finally, and  
8 we're here. So thanks so much for your support, before, as  
9 this all started, and then throughout the process. I  
10 appreciate that. And I thank our audience too, for your  
11 courtesy and your respect for this process. All right.  
12 Both parties will be given an opportunity to review the  
13 total record of the case when the verbatim transcript is  
14 completed and mailed. The Appellant or his or her  
15 representative will receive a copy of the transcript. I'd  
16 like to determine now how that's going to work. And  
17 typically what we'll do is send--the transcript will be  
18 mailed to--I'll get a copy.

19 LIEUTENANT COLONEL NIEDERGALL: We already  
20 worked it out, sir. When we get it, I'll get one copy and  
21 then we're going to reproduce it and ensure that everybody  
22 gets it so we don't have to--

23 HEARING EXAMINER: So everybody would be  
24 myself, Mr. Banchs, Captain Bedells? Okay. I have 45 days  
25 from the time I receive the verbatim transcript in order



1 to render a recommendation in this case. I will consider  
2 all the evidence that has been presented and then submit a  
3 report of findings and recommendations to the Adjutant  
4 General of Michigan through the human resource office. And  
5 just to be clear, I don't make the decision in these  
6 cases. My findings and recommendations will go to the TAG,  
7 and he'll make the final decision. A copy of my report  
8 will be given to the Appellant's representative. Typically  
9 what I'll do is send it to the HRO, and then they'll  
10 distribute, again, so they're kind of a conduit of the  
11 transcript and the official findings and recommendations  
12 report. You are advised that you may make any additional  
13 statements that you consider necessary to complete the  
14 record of this case at this time. Does the Agency have any  
15 additional statements?

16 CAPTAIN BEDELLS: No, sir.

17 HEARING EXAMINER: Does the Appellant have any  
18 additional statements?

19 MR. BANCHS: No, sir.

20 HEARING EXAMINER: In that case, I will  
21 declare this hearing closed. Thank you.

22 COURT REPORTER: The time is now 1:38 p.m.,  
23 and we are off the record.

24 (At 1:38 p.m., proceedings concluded)

25 -0-0-0-

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

RECORDER'S CERTIFICATE AND NOTARIZATION

I do hereby certify that on the date and at the place set forth on the title page hereof, there did personally appear before me, a Notary Public, the witness named on the title page; that I did swear said person to tell the truth and did then electronically record their testimony, the same being later reduced to typewriting, and that the foregoing is a true and accurate transcription of said electronic recording.

I further certify that I am not related to or employed by any party to this cause or their respective counsel.

Teresa A. Sotuyo



Teresa A. Sotuyo

Notary Public - CER - 4812

My commission expires: 2/26/2020